



CARLSBAD TOMORROW:  
GROWTH MANAGEMENT CITIZENS COMMITTEE

# Agenda

October 12, 2022, 5 p.m.  
Special Meeting

Faraday Center  
1635 Faraday Ave.  
Carlsbad, CA 92008

## Welcome to Carlsbad Tomorrow: Growth Management Citizens Committee Meeting

We welcome your interest and involvement in the city's legislative process. This agenda includes information about topics coming before the Growth Management Citizens Committee and the action recommended by city staff. You can read about each topic in the staff reports, which are available on the city website.

### How to watch

#### In Person



Growth Management Citizen Committee Meetings take place at the Faraday Center, 1635 Faraday Ave.

#### Online



Watch the livestream and replay past meetings on the city website, [carlsbadca.gov/residents/communication/city-tv-channel](https://carlsbadca.gov/residents/communication/city-tv-channel)

### How to participate

If you would like to provide comments to the Growth Management Citizens Committee, please:

- Fill out a speaker request form.
  - Submit the form to staff before the item begins.
  - When it's your turn, staff will call your name and invite you to the podium.
  - Speakers have three minutes unless the presiding officer (usually the chair) changes that time.
  - You may not give your time to another person, but groups can select a single speaker if three other members of your group are present. Group representatives have 10 minutes unless that time is changed by the presiding officer.
- 
- **In writing:** Email comments to [committee@carlsbadca.gov](mailto:committee@carlsbadca.gov). Comments received by 2:30 p.m. the day of the meeting will be shared with the committee prior to the meeting. When e-mailing comments, if the comment relates to a specific item on the agenda, please identify in the subject line the agenda item to which your comments relate. All comments received will be included as part of the official record. **Written comments will not be read out loud.**

### Reasonable accommodations

Persons with a disability may request an agenda packet in appropriate alternative formats as required by the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990. Reasonable accommodations and auxiliary aids will be provided to effectively allow participation in the meeting. Please contact the City Manager's Office at 760-434-2821 (voice), 711 (free relay service for TTY users), 760-720-9461 (fax) or [manager@carlsbadca.gov](mailto:manager@carlsbadca.gov) by noon on the Thursday before the meeting to make arrangements.

**CALL TO ORDER:**

**ROLL CALL:**

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:** *Review and approve minutes from the Sept. 22, 2022, meeting.*

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** *Members of the public are invited to comment on items both on and not on the agenda. Please treat others with courtesy, civility, and respect. In conformance with the Brown Act, public comment is provided so members of the public may participate in the meeting by submitting comments as provided on the front page of this agenda. The Carlsbad Tomorrow Growth Management Citizens Committee will receive comments for 15 minutes at the beginning of the meeting. As needed, public comments will continue at the end of the meeting. In conformance with the Brown Act, no action can occur on non-agenda public comment items.*

**WELCOME & INTRODUCTIONS:** *Open meeting and welcome attendees. Allow for any introductions for those staff not present at previous meetings. Review agenda and meeting format. Review purpose and charge for the committee.*

**DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

1. **COMMITTEE BUSINESS** – Collaborate and discuss the following topics:

- **Potential New Growth Management Topics.** Receive a brief overview from city staff and participate in a committee discussion on potential new growth management topics.  
(Eric Lardy, City Planner) (Exhibit 1)

**COMMITTEE MEMBER REQUESTS FOR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS:** *Highlight proposed focus for next meeting and invite committee member suggestions for topics or presentations to consider in upcoming meetings.*

**PUBLIC COMMENT:**

*Continuation of the public comments. This portion of the agenda is set aside for continuation of public comments, if necessary, due to exceeding the total time allotted in the first public comments section. Any remaining public comments shall be read into the record.*

**ADJOURN:** *Closing comments and adjourn meeting.*

**NEXT MEETING:**

Wednesday, Nov. 30, 2022, 5 p.m.

## Minutes

September 22, 2022

**CALL TO ORDER:** 5 p.m.

**ROLL CALL:**

**Present:**

Primary – Scott White, Eric Larson, Stephen “Hap” L’Heureux, Mike Howes, Mary Ryan, Frank Caraglio, Frances Schnall, Harry Peacock, Annika Jimenez, Fred Briggs, William Sheffler, Amy Allemann, Joe Stine, Patricia Mehan, Steve Linke

Alternate – Ron Withall, Patrick Goyarts, Jan Neff-Sinclair, Casey Carstairs, Erin Nell, Angela O’Hara, Nora Jimenez George, Allen Manzano, William Fowler

**Absent:**

Primary – Jeff Segall, Gita Nassiri, Chad Majer, John Nguyen-Cleary

Alternate – Don Christiansen, Terence Green, Thierry Ibri, Matthew Reese, Lisa Stark, Jamie Jacobs, Art Larson, Marissa Steketee, Kevin Sabellico,

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES:**

Motion by Hap L’Heureux, seconded by Scott White, to approve the August 25, 2022 minutes as amended.

**PUBLIC COMMENTS:**

One public comment was received.

**1. Public Park & Open Space –**

John Gama states that Zone 9, the southwest quadrant of Carlsbad, is short 30 acres of open space per city ordinance 29.10.130. After reading the ordinance to the committee, he explains that the original developers of the Ponto area were falsely exempted from this standard. He states that there is not 30 acres of open space per the standard. The recent Ponto Beach Village Project was denied by the Coastal Commission, and in their report required the city to investigate this area for visitor serving uses, ie a public park. Mr. Gama notes there is a 14.3-acre lot available for the city to purchase at a taxpayer savings compared to the currently proposed Pacific Coast Hwy relocation that doesn’t add any city land. Notes surveys have shown 85-91% of groups and citizens support a coastal park at Ponto. Mr. Gama expresses frustration with the city’s response to addressing the open space standard and park space deficiency. States a park at Ponto is consistent with all elements in the community vision. Notes that this situation has been detailed to the Mayor and City Council at official meetings to no avail. Implores committee to work with community to address deficiencies and make something special at the southern entrance to the city.

**2. MMLOS Methodology –**

Lori Robbins discusses MMLOS and its application to streets with railroad crossings. She expresses concern with the condo development happening close to streets with railroad crossings and the existing gridlock worsening with the development. Ms. Robbins would like to see considerations made for the negative impacts of gridlock to quality of life in the Village.

**3. Open Space –**

Howard Krausz representing North County Advocates. Reminds everyone the big picture of Proposition E setting forth standards for parks and open space as 15% of each LFMZ. Notes that the 15% should be in each of those so people don't travel to find open space. States 40% of Carlsbad was to be open space. Implores committee to find open space now or it will never happen. Mr. Krausz does not want exempted areas to not have any open space. Notes items should not be double counted, and things that aren't open space should not be counted as open space.

**4. Open Space/Parks –**

Michael Sebahar is a member of the Parks Commission. States there are opportunities for the commission to make a difference by the coast, by the smokestacks, and around Ponto to become areas where the community gathers, meets and reinforces community. Notes great projects have big obstacles but the results are worth it. Asks committee to see possibilities rather than obstacles and do something extraordinary with this property.

**5. Beaches –**

Kathy Steindlberger expresses support for Carlsbad beaches. Beaches are eroding at an alarming pace. Sand replenishment projects cost millions and two storms could come in the winter and all the sand would be gone. Cheaper to proactively deal with sea level rise than to react to it. Supports moving southbound Carlsbad Boulevard eastward but the impacts of development along the beach must be considered or there will be no sand left.

**6. Parks –**

Lance Schulte notes that People for Ponto have sent many documents to the city documenting the unfair distribution of parks and that the growth management open space standard was and is not met at Ponto. Ponto is missing 30 acres of growth management planned open space and Ponto coastal south Carlsbad is unserved by city parks. There is a willing seller of 14-acres of Ponto land that would be world class coastal park for Carlsbad. Such a park could host profitable community events and allow the city to apply for park grants. Mr. Schulte says this would save taxpayers 20-40 million compared to the PCH relocation. Asks for Ponto Park to be put into Growth Management Plan recommendation to the Council.

**7. Open Space –**

Diane Nygaard representing Preserve Calavera states Parks & Open Space is probably the most important performance standards to the members of this community. 40% open space was never a formal performance standard but was a goal. This goal was included in ballot arguments, campaign literature and city documents. Notes that when the growth management plan was adopted it planned for a build out population of 137,000, many less than is being planned for today. It didn't include today's density. Notes that the performance standard is 15% for each zone so everyone has access, not just half the city. When the performance standard was adopted, it did not say 11 of the 25 zones would be exempted. Meeting the open space performance standard was not one and done, it should be ongoing. Asks the committee to have meaningful access to nature be part of their legacy.

**WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS:**

Meeting opened with a welcome to attendees from Committee Chair Eric Larson, notes staff members are present that will be introduced as resources during the course of the meeting. City Planner Eric Lardy then briefly reviewed the committee's purpose and charter, the 11 existing performance standards, and the step-by-step process for the overall Growth Management Plan update. Facilitator Susan Harden reviewed the meeting agenda.

**DISCUSSION ITEMS:**

**COMMITTEE BUSINESS:**

- **Open Space.** Principal Planner, Eric Lardy provided a presentation and history on the City of Carlsbad Open Space Standard as it exists today. There was a question from the committee on how state housing laws limit changes to density and use. Eric Lardy explained that the city is limited on what they can do with land designated as residential. If something is residential the city can't change the General Plan designation to reduce the density without concurrently increasing density elsewhere. Eric Lardy and Jennifer Jesser, Senior Planner, answered questions on some of the details of the Open Space standard and history.

Several other clarifying questions were asked and the following thoughts, questions and considerations specific to the performance standard were captured:

- Perception of unequal distribution of open space throughout the City
- Exemptions seem arbitrary in hindsight
- An equitable assessment of access to open space across the whole city is important
- Update of Proposition C property list may be warranted; new proposition for additional funding could be proposed/passed
- The 15% standard doesn't solve all open space needs (trails, etc.)
- Recommend another ballot initiative to increase City Council's spending limit without a vote (update Prop H to reflect high cost of land)
- Acknowledge impact of sea level rise on the loss of beaches

Staff following up on some specific questions/requests from the Committee regarding open space:

- More detail on the 2005-2007 Prop C Citizens Committee property list
- Was the term "40%" open space specifically used in the ballot measure language?
- How much open + park space is in each of the 25 zones?

- **Parks.** City of Carlsbad Parks & Recreation Director, Kyle Lancaster, provided a presentation on the current Park Standard. Nancy Bragado of Bragado Planning provided a presentation on how Carlsbad compares to other cities in the San Diego region. Jeff Murphy, City of Carlsbad Community Development Director, answered questions related to the exemption of the Ponto property. Roxanne Muhlmeister, City of Carlsbad Assistant Finance Director, answered questions regarding park funding and if the Public Facility Fee Fund could be used.

Several additional clarifying questions were asked and the following thoughts, questions and considerations specific to the performance standard were captured:

- Like idea of citywide fee to get money up front as in-lieu fees don't produce enough money to pay for projects
- Prioritize park projects based on 10-minute walk to serve residents that don't have parks nearby to help address issues of equity
- Prioritize areas without parks within a 10-minute walk
- Ponto zone – concern that a previously approved (but never built) park resulted in it being exempt from open space standard
- Exemptions are to Open Space standard, exemptions are not to the Park Standard
- Question on Public Facility Fee Funds being used to fund park projects
  - Roxanne Muhlmeister, City of Carlsbad Assistant Finance Director, indicates PFF funds can be used for city facilities which include parks
  - Follow up question on how PFF funds are acquired.
  - Ms. Muhlmeister indicates they are development impact fees (not property taxes)
- Community Facility District 1 discussed; due scale down of City Hall relocation could those funds be repurposed through a court order or other mechanism to fund parks

- Roxanne Muhlmeister indicates if there is money left unused in that fund it would be redistributed back to the people that paid it.
- Environmental justice (EJ) briefly discussed and how it applies to the City of Carlsbad; currently no areas in the City designated as EJ areas
- Park In-Lieu fees can be used to purchase land for parks and build parks; fees are divided by quadrant
- Are we addressing what people want out of parks? In planning for parks do we also look at what people need? (response that Park Master Planning process does this)
- Concern when passive open spaces are counted as park space
- The impact of homeless on parks needs to be addressed
- Equal spread of large park across four quadrants seems to inflate SW quadrant number
- Counting golf courses as recreation area raises equity issues
- Explore an increase in standard (look at adjacent cities)
- Consider moving away from only measuring community parks
- Broaden concept of a park (community, neighborhood) for all
- Breakdown standards per thousand based on park type
- Take macro approach – citywide
- Interest in Tier 2 standard shared as part of presentation
- Look into using density transfers to create park space (and proactively address state mandates/new policies for housing)
- Concerned that lagoon trails are not counted as park recreation
- Impact of new parks on parks and transportation standards should be consistently applied (Veterans Park downplayed transportation impacts while overemphasizing new park access)

Staff following up on some specific questions/requests from the Committee regarding parks:

- Clarify whether in-lieu fees can be used for new parks (e.g. Ponto)
  - Is there a 10-minute walk study? A Trust for Public Land (TPL) study exists but doesn't count HOA (private recreation) facilities. Staff to provide a link.
  - What is the acreage/inventory of HOA/private parks?
- **Committee meeting schedule and topics.** Committee Chair Eric Larson discussed future meeting dates and future agenda items to be discussed. It was noted that the next meeting, occurring on October 12, will solely discuss items brought up outside of the 11 standards to make determinations on what happens with those items.

**COMMITTEE MEMBER REQUESTS FOR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS:**

- Committee members requested assessing rolling Arts into the Growth Management Plan. Cellular service/wifi in parks is suggested as a quality-of-life improvement.

**PUBLIC COMMENT:** None

**ADJOURNMENT:**

Chair Eric Larson adjourned the duly noticed meeting at 8:06 p.m.

CARLSBAD TOMORROW - GROWTH MANAGEMENT CITIZENS COMMITTEE  
STAFF REPORT – Exhibit 1  
OCT. 12, 2022

## POTENTIAL NEW GROWTH MANAGEMENT TOPICS

### Introduction

To date, the committee has reviewed and discussed information relative to the city's existing 11 growth management standards. This report is intended to help guide the committee's discussion on potential new growth management topics not addressed by the 11 existing standards.

When considering potential new growth management topics, the committee should consider the work product the committee is responsible for, as stated in the committee's charter:

***The committee will be responsible for reviewing work product and providing feedback to staff and consultants. The committee is expected to focus on input, review, and "buy-in" to carry out the committee's mission, rather than deliberating on precise details. The committee's work will conclude with a committee-supported report recommending to the City Council what should be included (key elements) in a new plan to manage growth and achieve an excellent quality of life while ensuring compliance with state law. The City Council will consider the committee's recommendations and direct the next steps to create a new growth management plan.***

### List of Potential New Growth Management Topics

At the committee's meeting on April 28, 2022, the committee participated in a facilitated discussion centered around the question - in terms of public facilities and services, what topics do you feel are most important to address in the future, and what should change about the current Growth Management Plan? The topics resulting from that discussion, and topics identified at other committee meetings, are listed in the attached matrix (**Attachment A – Topics Outside of 11 Existing Performance Standards**).

The matrix identifies relevant programs that currently address the topics, and provides questions to help the committee evaluate if the topic should be addressed by the city's growth management program, the questions include:

- Is this topic already adequately addressed [by the city or other agency]?
- Is this topic something the city can directly control?
- Could a nexus be made between future growth and this topic (should it be included in the growth management plan)?
- Should this topic be included in a quality-of-life memorandum from the committee to the City Council?

Keep the following in mind when reviewing the matrix:

- This is the current list of all the topics raised.
- You don't need to fill out the matrix before the meeting.

- You are not required to click on all the links, they are just for background information so committee members have an idea of how each topic is being addressed by other city programs or agencies.
- The goal of the matrix is to help sort and prioritize the potential new topics and determine if any should be considered further as new performance standards or separate recommendations for the City Council's consideration.

## Attachments

### **Attachment A – Topics Outside of 11 Existing Performance Standards**



## TOPICS OUTSIDE OF 11 EXISTING PERFORMANCE STANDARDS

Topic	Other related programs and agencies that address this topic in Carlsbad	Is this topic already adequately addressed?	Is this topic something the city can directly control?	Could a nexus be made between future growth and this topic? (should it be included in growth management plan)?	Should this topic be included in a quality-of-life memorandum from the Committee to the City Council?
Behavioral health	<a href="http://sandiegocounty.gov">County of San Diego Behavioral Health Services (sandiegocounty.gov)</a>				
Physical health	<a href="http://carlsbadca.gov/parksandrec">City of Carlsbad Parks &amp; Recreation Department programs and services (carlsbadca.gov/parksandrec)</a>  <a href="http://livewellsd.org">County Live Well San Diego Program (livewellsd.org)</a>				
Walkability	<a href="#">Age Friendly Action Plan</a>  <a href="#">Sustainable Mobility Plan</a>				
Public safety	<a href="#">City of Carlsbad Police Department Divisions &amp; Services</a>				
Homelessness	<a href="#">City of Carlsbad Housing &amp; Homeless Services Department</a>  <a href="#">Homeless Response Plan - Work Plan</a>				

Topic	Other related programs and agencies that address this topic in Carlsbad	Is this topic already adequately addressed?	Is this topic something the city can directly control?	Could a nexus be made between future growth and this topic? (should it be included in growth management plan)?	Should this topic be included in a quality-of-life memorandum from the Committee to the City Council?
Seniors/aging community	<a href="#">City of Carlsbad Age-Friendly Action Plan</a>  <a href="#">City of Carlsbad Parks &amp; Recreation Department senior programs and senior center</a>				
Senior Center operations	<a href="#">City of Carlsbad Senior Commission</a>  <a href="#">County Aging &amp; Independence Services</a>				
Arts and culture	<a href="#">City of Carlsbad Arts &amp; Culture Master Plan</a>  <a href="#">City of Carlsbad Library &amp; Cultural Arts programs and services</a>				

Topic	Other related programs and agencies that address this topic in Carlsbad	Is this topic already adequately addressed?	Is this topic something the city can directly control?	Could a nexus be made between future growth and this topic? (should it be included in growth management plan)?	Should this topic be included in a quality-of-life memorandum from the Committee to the City Council?
<b>Energy/power: local electric power generation</b>	<a href="#">Clean Energy Alliance</a> <a href="#">Energy Upgrade California</a> <a href="#">City of Carlsbad Environmental Sustainability Department programs to reduce energy use</a> <a href="#">City of Carlsbad New Power Plant</a>				
<b>Energy/power: renewable energy</b>	<a href="#">City of Carlsbad Home Energy Score Assessment Program</a> <a href="#">Property Assessed Clean Energy</a> <a href="#">California Solar Initiative</a>				
<b>Energy/power: reservoir solar panels</b>	<a href="#">California Clean Vehicle Rebate Project</a> <a href="#">Electric vehicle charging stations</a> <a href="#">Carlsbad Energy Center</a>				

Topic	Other related programs and agencies that address this topic in Carlsbad	Is this topic already adequately addressed?	Is this topic something the city can directly control?	Could a nexus be made between future growth and this topic? (should it be included in growth management plan)?	Should this topic be included in a quality-of-life memorandum from the Committee to the City Council?
<b>Water: Sources and supplies</b>	<a href="#">San Diego County Water Authority</a> <a href="#">Carlsbad Potable Water Master Plan</a> <a href="#">Carlsbad Municipal Water District water resources</a>				
<b>Water: Desalination</b>	<a href="#">Olivenhain Municipal Water District</a> <a href="#">Vallecitos Water District</a>				
<b>Water: Water quality</b>	<a href="#">Carlsbad Desalination Plant</a> <a href="#">Carlsbad water quality</a> <a href="#">San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board</a>				
<b>Water: Stormwater</b>	<a href="#">Storm Water Management and Discharge Control Ordinance (Chapter 15.12)</a> <a href="#">Carlsbad Municipal Water District Recycled Water Master Plan Update</a>				
<b>Water: Recycled water</b>	<a href="#">County Department of Environmental Health and Quality recycled water</a>				

Topic	Other related programs and agencies that address this topic in Carlsbad	Is this topic already adequately addressed?	Is this topic something the city can directly control?	Could a nexus be made between future growth and this topic? (should it be included in growth management plan)?	Should this topic be included in a quality-of-life memorandum from the Committee to the City Council?
Environmental sustainability: climate change	<a href="#">City of Carlsbad Climate Action Plan</a>				
	<a href="#">City of Carlsbad Draft Local Coastal Program (pending Coastal Commission approval)</a>				
Environmental sustainability: sea level rise	<a href="#">City of Carlsbad Sea Level Rise Vulnerability Assessment</a>				
Technology	<a href="#">City of Carlsbad Strategic Digital Investment Plan</a>				
	<a href="#">Connected Carlsbad Roadmap</a>				
Cellular service/Wi-Fi access	<a href="#">City of Carlsbad Innovation</a>				

Topic	Other related programs and agencies that address this topic in Carlsbad	Is this topic already adequately addressed?	Is this topic something the city can directly control?	Could a nexus be made between future growth and this topic? (should it be included in growth management plan)?	Should this topic be included in a quality-of-life memorandum from the Committee to the City Council?
Village development	<a href="#">Village &amp; Barrio Master Plan</a>  <a href="#">Village &amp; Barrio Objective Design Standards (underway)</a>				
Request for public park in Ponto area	Ponto Park fact sheet (received 9/22)  <a href="#">Growth Management Plan parks performance standard</a>				
Update Proposition H	<a href="#">Chapter 1.24 EXPENDITURE LIMITATION (qcode.us)</a>				