

CARLSBAD TOMORROW: GROWTH MANAGEMENT CITIZENS COMMITTEE

Agenda

Faraday Center 1635 Faraday Ave. Carlsbad, CA 92008

December 15, 2022, 5 p.m. Special Meeting

Welcome to Carlsbad Tomorrow: Growth Management Citizens Committee Meeting

We welcome your interest and involvement in the city's legislative process. This agenda includes information about topics coming before the Growth Management Citizens Committee and the action recommended by city staff. You can read about each topic in the staff reports, which are available on the city website.

How to watch

In Person



Growth Management Citizen Committee Meetings take place at the Faraday Center, 1635 Faraday Ave.



Online

Watch the livestream and replay past meetings on the city website, <u>carlsbadca.gov/residents/communication/city-</u> <u>tv-channel</u>

How to participate

If you would like to provide comments to the Growth Management Citizens Committee, please:

- Fill out a speaker request form.
- Submit the form to staff before the item begins.
- When it's your turn, staff will call your name and invite you to the podium.
- Speakers have three minutes unless the presiding officer (usually the chair) changes that time.
- You may not give your time to another person, but groups can select a single speaker if three other members of your group are present. Group representatives have 10 minutes unless that time is changed by the presiding officer.
- In writing: Email comments to <u>committee@carlsbadca.gov</u> Comments received by 2:30 p.m. the day of the meeting will be shared with the committee prior to the meeting. When e-mailing comments, if the comment relates to a specific item on the agenda, please identify in the subject line the agenda item to which your comments relate. All comments received will be included as part of the official record. <u>Written comments will not be read out loud</u>.

Reasonable accommodations

Persons with a disability may request an agenda packet in appropriate alternative formats as require by the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990. Reasonable accommodations and auxiliary aids will be provided to effectively allow participation in the meeting. Please contact the City Manager's Office at 760-434-2821 (voice), 711 (free relay service for TTY users), 760-720-9461 (fax) or manager@carlsbadca.gov by noon on the Thursday before the meeting to make arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER:

ROLL CALL:

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Review and approve minutes from the Nov. 30, 2022, meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Members of the public are invited to comment on items both on and not on the agenda. Please treat others with courtesy, civility, and respect. In conformance with the Brown Act, public comment is provided so members of the public may participate in the meeting by submitting comments as provided on the front page of this agenda. The Carlsbad Tomorrow Growth Management Citizens Committee will receive comments for 15 minutes at the beginning of the meeting. As needed, public comments will continue at the end of the meeting. In conformance with the Brown Act, no action can occur on non-agenda public comment items.

WELCOME & INTRODUCTIONS: Open meeting and welcome attendees. Allow for any introductions for those staff not present at previous meetings. Review agenda and meeting format. Review and clarify purpose and charge for the committee.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

- 1. <u>COMMITTEE BUSINESS</u> Collaborate and discuss the following topics:
 - **Walkability.** Receive a brief presentation on "walkability" and walkability in Carlsbad. (Nathan Schmidt, Transportation Planning and Mobility Manager)
 - **Circulation/Mobility Standard.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Circulation/Mobility standard keep as is, remove or update. Also participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding establishing a new standard for walkability. (Nathan Schmidt, Transportation Planning and Mobility Manager)
 - **Technology/Wi-Fi.** Receive a brief presentation on technology/Wi-Fi trends and city initiatives. (David Graham, Chief Innovation Officer)
 - Water Supply. Receive a brief presentation on Carlsbad water supply. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding establishing a new standard for water supply. (Dave Padilla, Utilities Engineering Manager)
 - Water Distribution Standard. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Water Distribution standard keep as is, remove or update. (Dave Padilla, Utilities Engineering Manager)
 - **Recycled Water.** Receive a brief presentation on recycled water in Carlsbad. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding establishing a new standard for recycled water. (Dave Padilla, Utilities Engineering Manager)
 - Sewer Collection System Standard. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Sewer Collection System standard keep as is, remove or update. (Dave Padilla, Utilities Engineering Manager)
 - Wastewater Treatment Standard. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Wastewater Treatment standard keep as is, remove or update. (Dave Padilla, Utilities Engineering Manager)
 - **Drainage Standard.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Drainage standard keep as is, remove or update. (Scott Lyle and Hossein Ajideh, Public Works)

<u>COMMITTEE MEETING SCHEDULE:</u> Update on upcoming meeting schedule.

<u>COMMITTEE MEMBER REQUESTS FOR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS:</u> Highlight proposed focus for next meeting and invite committee member suggestions for topics or presentations to consider in upcoming meetings.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Continuation of the public comments. This portion of the agenda is set aside for continuation of public comments, if necessary, due to exceeding the total time allotted in the first public comments section. Any remaining public comments shall be read into the record.

ADJOURN: Closing comments and adjourn meeting.

NEXT MEETING:

Wednesday, Jan. 11, 2023, 5 p.m.



Minutes

November 30, 2022

CALL TO ORDER: 5 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Present:

<u>Primary</u> – Jeff Segall, Scott White, Eric Larson, Jan Neff-Sinclair, Mike Howes, Mary Ryan, Frank Caraglio, Frances Schnall, Annika Jimenez, Gita Nassiri, Fred Briggs, Joe Stine, Steve Linke

<u>Alternate</u> – Ron Withall, Casey Carstairs, Don Christiansen, Terence Green, Nora Jimenez George, Allen Manzano, Thierry Ibri

Absent:

<u>Primary</u> – Stephen "Hap" L'Heureux, Harry Peacock, Chad Majer, John Nguyen-Cleary, William Sheffler, Amy Allemann, Patricia Mehan

<u>Alternate</u> – Patrick Goyarts, Matthew Reese, Erin Nell, Angela O'Hara, Lisa Stark, Jamie Jacobs, Art Larson, Marissa Steketee, Kevin Sabellico, William Fowler

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

A committee member wanted it noted that while the committee may not be involved in state requirements and current studies regarding sea level rise, the cumulative effects on quality of life, availability of beaches and tourism in the city make it an important topic.

Motion by Allen Manzano, seconded by Scott White, to approve the Oct. 12, 2022 minutes with the typographical error amended.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

There were no public speakers present.

WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS:

Meeting opened with a welcome to attendees from Committee Chair Eric Larson. City Planner Eric Lardy then briefly reviewed the committee's purpose and charter, the 11 existing performance standards, and the step-by-step process for the overall Growth Management Plan update. Facilitator Susan Harden reviewed the meeting agenda. Eric Lardy discussed that the meeting at hand will cover a few existing standards and a few topics that the committee asked for presentations on, or to be brought back for further discussion. The committee will decide what action to take with each of the topics, such as removing it from consideration as a standard, bringing it back for additional discussion around becoming a new standard or addressing it in a separate quality-of-life memo to the City Council.

COMMITTEE BUSINESS:

• **Carlsbad Tomorrow Report Sample Table of Contents and Sample Page.** Susan Harden reviewed the sample table of contents and a sample page of the Growth Management Citizens Committee Report. The committee had the following comments and recommendations around the format:

- Recommendation to highlight each performance standard as a page whether it's a new or existing standard, or if the recommendation is to remove an existing standard.
- There was discussion on incorporating the quality-of-life memo into the report, perhaps as an appendix or as a stand-alone section.
- There was a desire to have assumed growth projections for the City of Carlsbad listed upfront.
- The addition of an Executive Summary was requested.
- The committee would like the report to include text regarding the success, and any issues, of the original Growth Management Plan. Mike Howes' historical write up on the Growth Management Plan was referenced as a starting point.
- The committee asked for text to be included regarding the committee's process of considering new best practices, comparisons to other cities/municipalities, etc. to form the committee's recommendations where such benchmarks apply.
- There was discussion on adding a section on the funding challenges of collecting enough developer fees when there is limited growth left in the city, and the probability that the city will need to lead and pay for projects due to the limited developer fees moving forward.
- There was discussion on how State laws prevent the enforcing of Growth Management by the city and that potential and real impacts of State housing laws should be addressed in the report.
- It was noted that there is a need for a very clear nexus between impacts of future development and fees and fees charged or the State will throw them out.
- Discussion included the need for the report to address how the Growth Management Plan historically responded to growth when standards weren't met.
- **Fire Standard.** Staff's recommendation that the standard be removed from Growth Management to be replaced with annual evaluations of service in the city's operational planning was reviewed. City of Carlsbad Fire Chief, Michael Calderwood, was present to answer questions from the committee and to respond to the stated staff recommendation to remove the Fire Standard from the Growth Management Plan. The committee discussed what they perceived as pros and cons with removing the standard, expressing some concern with full removal. The committee discussed the following regarding mechanisms that could be put in place to ensure new growth doesn't negatively impact the Fire Department's capabilities if the Fire Standard is removed from the Growth Management Program:
 - o Develop a community risk assessment (analysis) specific to the Fire Department
 - Develop a separate program or fee to help pay for capital costs associated with growth (e.g. new ladder trucks)
 - Annual review program
 - o Refer to a detailed document outside of the Growth Management Program
 - Fire impact fee updated regularly (annually, biannually, every five years?) and incorporated into the Growth Management Program
 - Direct impact of very large development projects should be considered
 - Can standard be placed upon city rather than developer?
 - Suggestion that performance standards for service should be outside of the Growth Management Plan
 - Action: City staff and Chief Calderwood will take the comments generated during the discussion and come back to the committee with further recommendations around including some form of Fire Standard in the Growth Management Program, including the possibility for the Growth Management Program to direct to standards set forth in a stand-alone document.
- **Police.** City of Carlsbad Police Chief, Mickey Williams, provided a presentation on the city's Police Department. Chief Williams discussed how it's difficult to measure the Police Department's performance with a single measurement, and that much like the Fire Department, there are many

metrics and considerations involved, along with the ever-changing dynamics of the department – i.e. homeless response officers are a new component. Chief Williams discussed how the growth of the Police Department has been primarily related to community concerns and policy (school resource officers, active shooter, vaping, homelessness) not development growth. He stated the needs and growth of law enforcement is not directly tied to the number of houses or type of development. Chief Williams is not recommending a Police performance standard be included in the Growth Management Plan but recommends having the Police Department consulted as growth is considered to determine likely Police impact. Also of importance is what growth or development is replacing. The committee discussed the following:

- Consider combined "Public Safety" standard for Fire and Police
- How does growth impact capital expenses? (police cars, etc.)
- \circ If the Fire Standard is kept, there should be a Police Standard too
- o Develop an Annual Review Program, similar to the Fire Chief's suggestion
- \circ $\,$ Opinion expressed that a Police Standard is not needed
- The standard could mandate staff to assess level of service
 - Action: By consensus, the committee requested to have staff, the Fire Chief, and the Police Chief collaborate on a recommendation or idea on an approach for addressing Public Safety, particularly as it relates to future growth in the City of Carlsbad.
- Library Standard. Fiona Everett, Senior Management Analyst, and Katie Nye and Sheila Crosby, Deputy Directors of Library & Cultural Arts, provided their reasoning behind recommending that the Library Standard remain as it is in the Growth Management Plan. The committee briefly discussed if the standard is necessary based on build out projections. The committee was reminded that due to state mandates the future development could change the projections.
 - Action: By consensus, the committee moved to leave the Library Standard as is.
- Arts/Culture. Richard Shultz, Cultural Arts Manager, provided a presentation on arts and culture, and its history, in the City of Carlsbad. Mr. Schultz reviewed the many City Council adopted/approved documents related to culture arts. He notes current public art funding is 1% through Capital Improvement Program (CIP) projects, whereas most other cities in the state have been at 2% for a long time. Mr. Schultz discussed potential funding mechanisms for a venue in the city. The committee discussed the following:
 - Encouraging the City Council to increase 1% allocation to 2% in CIP
 - There was a belief expressed that Cultural Arts belongs in a quality-of-life memo rather than the Growth Management Plan.
 - In the Growth Management Plan, a percent would apply to developer projects, which aren't projected to amount to much moving forward
 - Can a nexus be made?
 - Concern expressed about the cumulative impacts of imposing developer fees
 - Discussion around the Growth Management Plan and the quality-of-life memo being of equal importance
 - Action: By consensus, the committee moved to bring back ideas/language for a
 potential Culture and Arts Performance Standard, with no commitment on the
 committee's part for a decision on where to include Culture and Arts.
- **City Administrative Facilities Standard.** Chair Eric Larson reviewed the staff recommendation to remove the City Administrative Facilities Standard from the Growth Management Program because the standard is no longer reflective of business operations and the new civic center and city hall project has been authorized in August 2022 to move forward.
 - Action: By consensus, the committee moved to remove the City Administrative Facilities Standard from the Growth Management Program.
- **Schools Standard.** Chair Eric Larson reviewed the staff recommendation to remove the Schools Standard from the Growth Management Program because state law requires annual coordination.

• Action: By consensus, the committee moved to remove the Schools Standard from the Growth Management Program.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

• **Committee meeting schedule and topics.** Chair Eric Larson reminded the committee that the next meeting will occur in two weeks on December 15, 2022, and the following meeting on January 11, 2023.

COMMITTEE MEMBER REQUESTS FOR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS:

- It was requested that staff more fully clarify if all Growth Management Standards will assume a related developer fee or if some standards might be performance-based without an associated fee.
- Based on some discussion and questions from committee members, staff will share the following information links: SANDAG population materials/presentation, Growth Management in other cities presentation materials, the City of Chula Vista Capital Improvements Program, and City of Carlsbad Capital Improvements Program dashboard.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None

ADJOURNMENT:

Chair Eric Larson adjourned the duly noticed meeting at 8:25 p.m.

Michele Hardy – Minutes Clerk



GROWTH MANAGEMENT CITIZENS COMMITTEE

Staff Report

Meeting Date:	Dec. 15, 2022
То:	Growth Management Citizens Committee
Staff Contact:	Eric Lardy, City Planner Eric.Lardy@carlsbadca.gov
	Sarah Lemons, Communication & Engagement Sarah.Lemons@carlsbadca.gov
Subject	Committee Business

Recommended Action

Receive presentations and discuss the following topics:

- **Walkability.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding establishing a new standard for walkability.
- **Circulation/Mobility Standard.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Circulation/Mobility standard keep as is, remove or update (Exhibit 1). Transportation staff will be available for questions.
- **Technology/Wi-Fi.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding establishing a new standard for technology/Wi-Fi. Chief Innovation Officer will be available for questions.
- Water Supply. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding establishing a new standard for water supply. Public Works staff will be available for questions.
- Water Distribution Standard. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Water Distribution standard keep as is, remove or update (Exhibit 2). Library staff will be available for questions. Public Works staff will be available for questions.
- Recycled Water. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding establishing a new standard for recycled water. Public Works staff will be available for questions.
- Sewer Collection System Standard. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Sewer Collection System standard keep as is, remove or update (Exhibit 3). Public Works staff will be available for questions.
- Wastewater Treatment Standard. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Wastewater Treatment standard keep as is, remove or update (Exhibit 4). Public Works staff will be available for questions.
- **Drainage Standard.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Drainage standard keep as is, remove or update (Exhibit 5). Public Works staff will be available for questions.

Fiscal Analysis

This action has no fiscal impact.

Environmental Evaluation

In keeping with California Public Resources Code Section 21065, this action does not constitute a "project" within the meaning of the California Environmental Quality Act in that it has no potential to cause either a direct physical change in the environment, or a reasonably foreseeable indirect physical change in the environment. Therefore, it does not require environmental review.

Public Notification and Outreach

This item was noticed in keeping with the Ralph M. Brown Act and it was available for public viewing and review at least 72 hours before the scheduled meeting date.

Exhibits

- 1. Circulation/Mobility Standard Summary of Previous Committee Discussion and Options
- 2. Water Distribution Standard Summary of Previous Committee Discussion and Options
- 3. Sewer Collection Standard Summary of Previous Committee Discussion and Options
- 4. Wastewater Treatment Standard Summary of Previous Committee Discussion and Options
- 5. Drainage Standard Summary of Previous Committee Discussion and Options



Circulation - Discussed July 28, 2022, and August 25, 2022

Implement a comprehensive livable streets network that serves all users of the system – vehicles, pedestrians, bicycles and public transit. Maintain LOS (Level of Service) D or better for all modes that are subject to this multi-modal level of service (MMLOS) standard, as identified in Table 3-1 of the General Plan Mobility Element, excluding LOS exempt intersections and streets approved by the City Council.

	LOS exempt intersections and streets approved by the City Council.				
	Options for Consideration				
 Key Takeaways from Committee Discussion on Standard Identify reasons why a Multimodal Level of Service (MMLOS) hasn't been reported for monitoring purposes. Consider that MMLOS is a new methodology unique to the city of Carlsbad and was adopted with the General Plan update and is being updated internally to meet the needs of our city. Develop a local level of service (LOS) standard for projects without Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT) monitoring that are exempt from CEQA requirements. Keep MMLOS as the standard Consider methods or ways for the city or developer to measure or monitor Personal Miles Traveled (PMT) to understand how all users of the system utilize our transportation network versus only motorized vehicle drivers Consider concerns about timing and complexity; and whether the PMT model is flexible. Solana Beach uses PMT and was briefly described. Committee would like to hear more about how this works in Solana Beach. Provide an opportunity for the Committee to learn more about Solana Beach PMT operations. Remain cognizant of the need for flexibility Consider the potential merits of developing a "shopping" list of custom standards instead of a single standard. 					
Provide an opportunity for the Committee to learn more about Solana Beach PMT operations. Remain cognizant of the need for flexibility Consider the potential merits of developing a	the city would be able to collect development fees to help fund other mobility improvements for all the ways people travel around Carlsbad, like bike infrastructure and wider				
 single standard. New options presented tonight are exciting Conduct a study to determine whether the current LOS standards are being implemented appropriately. Review exemptions from the current vehicle LOS standard and determine whether there is a missing link between multimodal transportation and increased multimodal safety rather than 					

 Develop a plan for the PMT model to be updated regularly to reflect future mobility options and advancements in technology Identify funding and next steps for developing and a real and comprehensive nexus study. Identify ways to target the standard to specific needs while also looking at the bigger multi-modal vision/system. Consider using both direct mitigation and indirect mitigation. 			
Notes or Resources			
Approved minutes from the August 25, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. <u>PowerPoint presentation</u> from July 28, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. <u>PowerPoint presentation</u> from August 25, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. <u>Agenda packet</u> (staff report for Circulation item begins on page 13) from the July 28, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. <u>Sustainable Mobility Plan</u>			
Nexus/Funding Sources			
Community Facility District #1			
Bridge and Thoroughfare Districts			
Assessment districts, developer contributions			
Gas taxes			
Traffic Impact Fees			
County transportation taxes			
Federal and state grants			
Public Facility Impact Fees			
a Concernal found			

• General fund



Water Distribution System - Discussed June 23, 2022

Line capacity to meet demand as determined by the appropriate water district must be provided concurrent with development. A minimum of 10-day average storage capacity must be provided prior to any development.

Key Takeaways from Committee Discussion on Standard	Options for Consideration		
 Consider the cost of storing water versus treating additional water. Discussion on if reservoir size is large enough for recycled water activity. Consider what the maximum water consumption the city would be able to accommodate. Evaluate if the performance standard assumes water will always be available. Assess city's water sourcing criteria. Discussion that Carlsbad is an importer of water. Consider a standard that maximizes use of recycled water, graywater, etc. The city can use while still conserving water. Consider cost impacts of conservation-related standards. This standard seeks to understand the purveyance of water, not the availability of water. Provide standards and/or impacts of the other two water districts that serve the City of Carlsbad. 	 Keep standard as it exists in Growth Management Program. Remove standard from Growth Management Program. Remove standard (increase, decrease, modify metric, etc.). Change standard (increase, decrease, modify metric, etc.). Staff recommends retaining the portion of the standard requiring line capacity concurrent with development. Staff recommends removing the minimum 10-day storage capacity requirement; it is not directly related to the provision of water supply related to growth within the city. 		
Notes or Resources			

Approved minutes from the June 23, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. <u>PowerPoint presentation</u> from the June 23, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. <u>Agenda packet</u> (staff report for the Water Distribution Facilities item begins on page 19) from the June 23, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting.

- Developer fees
- Developer contributions
- User fees



Sewer Collection System - Discussed June 23, 2022

Trunk-line capacity to meet demand, as determined by the appropriate sewer districts, must be provided concurrent with development.

 Consider how the influx in ADUs (accessory dwelling units) impacts pipes, the water treatment plant and water usage; need to be sure these units are captured Consider adding ADUs into future land use master plans and overall city projections. Consider effective ways to estimate how much capacity we need, and the type of infrastructure future facilities will need. Assess how to best estimate peak capacity in future. Assess legal ramifications if the city cannot keep up sewer performance with housing demands imposed by the state. Assess if we are still legally required to grow. Assess if climate change threatens any city assets or infrastructure. Climate change is a bigger threat to water supply. Re-evaluate the fee structure for infill and sewer connections. Notes or Resources

Approved minutes from the June 23,2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. PowerPoint presentation from the June 23,2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. Agenda packet (staff report for Sewer Collection item begins on page 16) from the June 23, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting.

- Developer fees
- Developer contributions
- User fees



Wastewater Treatment - Discussed June 23, 2022				
Sewer plant capacity is adequate for at least a five-year period.				
Key Takeaways from Committee Discussion on Standard	Options for Consideration			
 Determine if performance standards are the same as the Leucadia District and other water districts. Define how that process works. Consider effects of housing growth on sewage – determine what happens when we are at capacity. Evaluate how growth outside of Carlsbad affects plant capacity. Assess connection between recycled water facilities and the water performance standards. Evaluate need for a new recycled water performance standard or other conservation activities. Make standard more than just capacity. Evaluate potential for the city to sell extra capacity with facilities to nearby cities. Evaluate if there is a potable reuse opportunity - turning tertiary treated recycled water into potable drinking water. Discuss expense of this option. 	 Keep standard as exists in Growth Management Program. Remove standard from Growth Management Program. Staff recommends removal of this standard from the Growth Management Program. Sufficient planning processes and efforts exist to maintain sewer system capacity through the involvement within the Joint Powers Authority and the city capacity. Change standard (increase, decrease, modify metric, etc.). 			
Notes or Resources				

Approved minutes from the June 23, 2022, Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. <u>PowerPoint presentation</u> from the June 23, 2022, Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. <u>Agenda packet</u> (staff report for the Wastewater Treatment item begins on page 14) from the June 23, 2022, Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting.

- Developer fees
- Developer contributions
- User fees



Approved minutes from the June 23, 2022, Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. <u>PowerPoint presentation</u> from the June 23, 2022, Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting. <u>Agenda packet</u> (staff report for Drainage item begins on page 12) from the June 23, 2022, Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting.

- Drainage area impact fees
- Gas taxes
- General fund