



CARLSBAD TOMORROW:
GROWTH MANAGEMENT CITIZENS COMMITTEE

Faraday Center
1635 Faraday Ave.
Carlsbad, CA 92008

Agenda

January 11, 2023, 5 p.m.
Special Meeting

Welcome to Carlsbad Tomorrow: Growth Management Citizens Committee Meeting

We welcome your interest and involvement in the city's legislative process. This agenda includes information about topics coming before the Growth Management Citizens Committee and the action recommended by city staff. You can read about each topic in the staff reports, which are available on the city website.

How to watch

In Person



Growth Management Citizen Committee Meetings take place at the Faraday Center, 1635 Faraday Ave.

Online



Watch the livestream and replay past meetings on the city website, carlsbadca.gov/residents/communication/city-tv-channel

How to participate

If you would like to provide comments to the Growth Management Citizens Committee, please:

- Fill out a speaker request form.
 - Submit the form to staff before the item begins.
 - When it's your turn, staff will call your name and invite you to the podium.
 - Speakers have three minutes unless the presiding officer (usually the chair) changes that time.
 - You may not give your time to another person, but groups can select a single speaker if three other members of your group are present. Group representatives have 10 minutes unless that time is changed by the presiding officer.
- **In writing:** Email comments to committee@carlsbadca.gov. Comments received by 2:30 p.m. the day of the meeting will be shared with the committee prior to the meeting. When e-mailing comments, if the comment relates to a specific item on the agenda, please identify in the subject line the agenda item to which your comments relate. All comments received will be included as part of the official record. **Written comments will not be read out loud.**

Reasonable accommodations

Persons with a disability may request an agenda packet in appropriate alternative formats as required by the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990. Reasonable accommodations and auxiliary aids will be provided to effectively allow participation in the meeting. Please contact the City Manager's Office at 760-434-2821 (voice), 711 (free relay service for TTY users), 760-720-9461 (fax) or manager@carlsbadca.gov by noon on the Thursday before the meeting to make arrangements.

CALL TO ORDER:

ROLL CALL:

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: *Review and approve minutes from the Nov. 30, 2022, meeting.*

PUBLIC COMMENT: *Members of the public are invited to comment on items both on and not on the agenda. Please treat others with courtesy, civility, and respect. In conformance with the Brown Act, public comment is provided so members of the public may participate in the meeting by submitting comments as provided on the front page of this agenda. The Carlsbad Tomorrow Growth Management Citizens Committee will receive comments for 15 minutes at the beginning of the meeting. As needed, public comments will continue at the end of the meeting. In conformance with the Brown Act, no action can occur on non-agenda public comment items.*

WELCOME & OPENING COMMENTS: *Open meeting and welcome attendees. Review and clarify purpose and charge for the committee. Review agenda and meeting format.*

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

1. **COMMITTEE BUSINESS** – Collaborate and discuss the following topics:

- **Open Space Standard.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Open Space standard – keep as is, remove or update. (Eric Lardy, City Planner)
- **Parks Standard.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Parks standard – keep as is, remove or update. (Kyle Lancaster, Parks & Recreation Director)
- **Climate Action Plan.** Receive a presentation on the Carlsbad Climate Action Plan and what the city is doing around renewable energy, power, environmental sustainability, etc. (Katie Hentrich, Climate Action Plan Administrator).
- **Local Electric Power Generation and Renewable Energy and Environmental Sustainability/Climate Change.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction for the preceding topics. (Katie Hentrich, Climate Action Plan Administrator)
- **Water Quality/Stormwater.** Receive a brief presentation on stormwater capture and water quality in Carlsbad. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction on the topic. (James Wood, Environmental Management Director)
- **Senior Commission Committee Member.** Participate in a discussion on whether to recruit a new member from the Senior Commission. Per the Committee Charter, at the next scheduled meeting, the committee will consider whether to recommend that the Mayor and City Council fill the vacated position. Both the primary and alternate member have resigned so there is currently no Senior Commission representative.

COMMITTEE MEETING SCHEDULE: *Update on upcoming meeting schedule.*

COMMITTEE MEMBER REQUESTS FOR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS: *Highlight proposed focus for next meeting and invite committee member suggestions for topics or presentations to consider in upcoming meetings.*

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Continuation of the public comments. This portion of the agenda is set aside for continuation of public comments, if necessary, due to exceeding the total time allotted in the first public comments section. Any remaining public comments shall be read into the record.

ADJOURN: *Closing comments and adjourn meeting.*

NEXT MEETING:

Thursday, Jan. 26, 2023, 5 p.m.

Minutes

December 15, 2022

CALL TO ORDER: 5 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Present:

Primary – Jeff Segall, Eric Larson, Stephen “Hap” L’Heureux, Mary Ryan, Frank Caraglio, Frances Schnell, Harry Peacock, Annika Jimenez, Gita Nassiri, Fred Briggs, Joe Stine, Steve Linke

Alternate – Patrick Goyarts, Jan Neff-Sinclair, Casey Carstairs, Don Christiansen, Thierry Ibri, Angela O’Hara, Lisa Stark, Allen Manzano, Marissa Steketee, Kevin Sabellico, William Fowler

Absent:

Primary – Scott White, Mike Howes, Chad Majer, John Nguyen-Cleary, William Sheffler, Amy Allemann, Patricia Mehan

Alternate – Ron Withall, Terence Green, Matthew Reese, Erin Nell, Nora Jimenez George, Jamie Jacobs, Art Larson

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Motion by Frank Caraglio, seconded by Jeff Segall, to approve the Nov. 30, 2022 minutes.

PUBLIC COMMENTS:

One public comment was received.

1. Parks and Open Space –

Lance Schulte asked that a park at Ponto be included in the committee’s recommendation to the City Council. Mr. Schulte also suggested the committee maintain a 15% growth management open space standard.

WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS:

Meeting opened with a welcome to attendees from Committee Chair Eric Larson. City Planner Eric Lardy then briefly reviewed the committee’s purpose and charter, with emphasis on the mission, the 11 existing performance standards, how the Growth Management Plan is implemented, the committee process, and the next steps in the Growth Management Program update process. Mr. Lardy briefly went over the role of the General Plan and the Housing Element and reminded the committee that SANDAG statistics related to projected population growth and demographics were redistributed in their committee packet. Facilitator Susan Harden reviewed the meeting agenda.

COMMITTEE BUSINESS:

- **Walkability.** City of Carlsbad Transportation Planning and Mobility Manager, Nathan Schmidt, provided a presentation on the term “walkability” and walkability in the city. The following committee discussion occurred:
 - Concern expressed that walkability is not elevated enough in the current standard and a desire stated that in the subsequent discussion (on the Mobility/Circulation Standard) a way be found

- to elevate walkability as a key quality of life indicator for the next iteration (of the Growth Management Program).
- Concern expressed about how past city policies have resulted in no parks within a walkable distance in certain areas of the city.
 - There was discussion on how a nexus can be made between a development adding pedestrians to the streets and requiring the developer to add amenities to make the streets more walkable.
 - There was an opinion stated that future developments will be mainly condos, apartments and hotels, therefore in the planning there should be a demand on the developer to include benefits to the general public such as pathways and trails.
 - The definition of “walkability” was discussed and noted that the term is defined in many different ways.
 - The comment was made that the Growth Management Program has been in place for 30+ years and the updated program will likely be in place for decades to come. The updated program is an opportunity to drive accountability to master planning, and the place topics like walkability can be elevated in importance.
 - It was again noted that land use plays a large part in walkability.
- **Circulation/Mobility Standard.** City of Carlsbad Transportation Planning and Mobility Manager, Nathan Schmidt, Stephen Cook from Intersecting Metrics, and Katy Cole from Fehr & Peers provided a presentation recapping the prior Circulation and Mobility Standard presentation and discussed the current standard, what has changed since the current standard was adopted, the limitations of the current standard and the staff recommendation to update the metric in the standard. Staff recommended the Circulation Standard be changed to use Personal Miles Traveled as the measurement and use the Multi Modal Transportation Impact Fee to fund future mobility projects and accommodate future growth. The committee discussed the following:
 - Incorporate other alternative modes (shuttles, self-driving cars)
 - Generally supportive of the draft language/recommendation proposed by staff
 - Concern expressed regarding the loss of Level of Service D requirement as part of the standard. Per staff, Transportation Demand Management would still be required.
 - Concern that it seemed the “performance standard” was being removed from the Growth Management Program and directed to the Sustainable Mobility Plan.
 - Communication with the public will be important if the Level of Service requirement is removed from the standard so that the public understands how quality of roads is being evaluated and measured going forward.
 - The question was raised regarding whether to establish a standard or threshold for Personal Miles Traveled.
 - Concern expressed that Level of Service doesn’t measure walkability.
 - Concern expressed about transparency on fees collected. Staff noted AB602 requires the city to publish the amount of fees collected and on what projects the money was spent.
 - Concern expressed that although the draft language proposed for a revised standard state “all users”, it does not account for tourists/visitors. Staff indicated that as tourism relates to a new development, the impact of tourists from that development is accounted for through the Personal Miles Traveled evaluation for the development.
 - Can language be “hardened” around Personal Miles Traveled to serve more as a firm standard so that here is an “enforcement mechanism” through the Growth Management Program?
 - Concern expressed that the staff recommendation is a policy not a growth management standard and opinion that the Level of Service metric needs to remain in the standard.
 - Consider Personal Miles Traveled or Local Mobility Assessment into language of the standard.

- Update the Multi Modal Transportation Impact Fee, but also include Local Mobility Assessment with Level of Service for all modes; or add these recommendations to the separate quality of life memo for City Council's consideration.
 - **Action:** Motion to recommend draft Circulation/Mobility Performance Standard language by Frank Caraglio, seconded by Stephen L'Heureux.
 - **Action:** Substitute motion by Frances Schnall, seconded by Steve Linke, to amend the original motion on the floor to leave the Level of Service and Local Mobility Assessment in the standard as the metric for direct impacts rather than moving it to the quality-of-life memo.
 - Comment on the amendment to have staff draft new recommended language rather than the committee.
 - Desire expressed for both the cumulative impacts = Multi Modal Transportation Impact Fee and the direct impacts = Level of Service/Local Mobility Assessment to be included in the performance standard.
 - **Action:** Frances Schnall withdraws her substitute motion and Steve Linke agrees to withdraw the second; Frank Caraglio withdraws his original motion and Hap L'Heureux agrees to withdraw the second.
 - **Action:** *By consensus, committee moves to bring the Mobility/Circulation Standard back to the committee with revised language from staff that reflects feedback from the committee.*
- **Technology/Wi-Fi.** City of Carlsbad Chief Innovation Officer, David Graham, provided a presentation to the committee on "Connected Communities" and what role technology plays in growth, mobility and land use. No further committee discussion followed.
- **Water Supply.** Dave Padilla, City of Carlsbad Utilities Engineering Manager, provided a presentation on water supply. Staff recommended not to establish a performance standard for water supply.
 - Discussion on the purchase of desalinated water.
 - Question on if assessments are made on future costs to source water and the impact on residents.
 - **Action:** By consensus, the committee agreed a water supply standard is not needed.
- **Water Distribution Standard.** Dave Padilla, City of Carlsbad Utilities Engineering Manager, provided a presentation on the existing Water Distribution Performance Standard. Staff recommended retaining the portion of the standard requiring line capacity concurrent with development. Staff recommended removing the minimum 10-day storage capacity requirement since it is not directly related to the provision of water supply related to growth within the city and the region maintains much larger storage capacity. The committee discussed the following:
 - The question was asked about the benefit of removing the 10-day storage capacity. What is the downside to keeping it?
 - Eliminate the 10-day storage capacity language from the standard since it's just a box to check and this will be achieved without inclusion in the performance standard
 - **Action:** By consensus, the committee agreed to move forward with the staff recommendation to maintain the requirement for line capacity and remove the 10-day storage capacity requirement from the performance standard
- **Recycled Water.** Dave Padilla, City of Carlsbad Utilities Engineering Manager, provided a presentation on the city's recycled water supply. Staff recommended not to establish a performance standard for recycled water.
 - Question on if there is an incentive for a new developer to connect to the city's recycled water system. Staff states there's a state mandate for developers with an irrigation need to connect to the city's recycled water system.
 - Question on the Pure Water San Diego Project and whether the city has considered turning recycled water into potable water. Staff indicated studies are being conducted, but it's a very expensive process.
 - Discussion on whether development is occurring where the recycled water system doesn't exist.

- **Action:** By consensus, the committee agreed a recycled water performance standard is not needed.
- **Sewer Collection System Standard.** Dave Padilla, City of Carlsbad Utilities Engineering Manager, provided a presentation on the existing Sewer Collection System Standard. Staff recommended retaining this standard in the Growth Management Program in order to continue to require sewer line connection and capacity concurrent with development.
 - **Action:** By consensus, the committee moved to retain the standard as is to require sewer line capacity concurrent with development.
- **Wastewater Treatment Standard.** Dave Padilla, City of Carlsbad Utilities Engineering Manager, provided a presentation on the existing Wastewater Treatment Standard. Staff recommended removal of this standard from the Growth Management Program. Sufficient planning processes and efforts exist to maintain sewer system capacity through the involvement within the Joint Powers Authority and the city capacity.
 - **Action:** By consensus, the committee agreed to move forward with the staff recommendation to remove the Wastewater Treatment Standard from the Growth Management Program.
- **Drainage Standard.** Scott Lyle, City of Carlsbad Senior Engineer, provided a presentation on the existing Drainage Performance Standard. Staff recommended the drainage standard remain as is in the Growth Management Program because it has worked to support continued management of drainage facilities in the city.
 - Non-drainage question raised on whether or not the committee should be making any recommendations to City Council through the quality of life memo on standards that are being removed – such as a studies that need to be conducted, or fees evaluated on a cyclical basis.
 - Comment on education component for water conservation and if that could be a fee to developers in the Growth Management Program.
 - Question posed regarding relationship to water quality. Noted that staff and the committee would be discuss this topic in the next committee meeting.
 - **Action:** By consensus, the committee moved to retain the Drainage Standard as is in the Growth Management Program, requiring drainage facilities required by the city concurrent with development.

DISCUSSION ITEMS:

- **Committee meeting schedule and topics.** Facilitator Susan Harden reminded the committee that the next meeting will occur on Jan. 11, 2023, and will cover the open space and parks standards, and there will be presentations on the Climate Action Plan and water quality. The following meeting will take place two weeks later on Jan. 26, 2023, with the agenda dictated by outcomes of the Jan. 11 meeting.

COMMITTEE MEMBER REQUESTS FOR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS:

- No future agenda items were brought forth by the committee.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None

ADJOURNMENT:

Chair Eric Larson adjourned the duly noticed meeting at 8:28 p.m.



GROWTH MANAGEMENT CITIZENS COMMITTEE

Staff Report

Meeting Date: Jan. 11, 2023

To: Growth Management Citizens Committee

Staff Contact: Eric Lardy, City Planner
Eric.Lardy@carlsbadca.gov

Sarah Lemons, Communication & Engagement
Sarah.Lemons@carlsbadca.gov

Subject Committee Business

Recommended Action

Receive presentations and discuss the following topics:

- **Open Space Standard.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Open Space standard – keep as is, remove or update. See Exhibit 1 for a summary of the committee’s previous discussion on the open space standard and staff’s recommendation.
- **Parks Standard.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction regarding the Parks standard – keep as is, remove or update. See Exhibit 2 for a summary of the committee’s previous discussion on the parks standard and staff’s recommendation.
- **Climate Action Plan.** Receive a presentation from city staff on the Carlsbad Climate Action Plan - what the city is doing around renewable energy, power, environmental sustainability, etc.
- **Local Electric Power Generation and Renewable Energy and Environmental Sustainability/Climate Change.** Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction for the following topics: local electric power generation, renewable energy, and environmental sustainability/climate change.
- **Water Quality/Stormwater.** Receive a brief presentation from city staff on stormwater capture and water quality in Carlsbad. Participate in a committee discussion to determine direction on the topic.
- **Senior Commission Committee Member.** Participate in a discussion on whether to recruit a new member from the Senior Commission. Per the Committee Charter, at the next scheduled meeting, the committee will consider whether to recommend that the Mayor and City Council fill the vacated position. Both the primary and alternate member have resigned so there is currently no Senior Commission representative.

Fiscal Analysis

This action has no fiscal impact.

Environmental Evaluation

In keeping with California Public Resources Code Section 21065, this action does not constitute a “project” within the meaning of the California Environmental Quality Act in that it has no potential to cause either a direct physical change in the environment, or a reasonably foreseeable indirect physical change in the environment. Therefore, it does not require environmental review.

Public Notification and Outreach

This item was noticed in keeping with the Ralph M. Brown Act and it was available for public viewing and review at least 72 hours before the scheduled meeting date.

Exhibits

1. Open Space Standard – Summary of Previous Committee Discussion and Options
2. Parks Standard – Summary of Previous Committee Discussion and Options

Open Space - Discussed September 22, 2022

Fifteen percent of the total land area in the Local Facility Management Zone (LFMZ) exclusive of environmentally constrained non-developable land must be set aside for permanent open space and must be available concurrent with development.

Key Takeaways from Committee Discussion on Standard	Options for Consideration
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Perception of unequal distribution of open space throughout the city • Seems arbitrary that standard isn't applicable in LFMZs 1-10 and 16. • An equitable assessment of access to open space across the whole city is important • Update of Proposition C property list may be warranted; new proposition for additional funding could be proposed/passed • The 15% standard doesn't solve all open space needs (trails, etc.) • Suggestion to recommend another ballot initiative to increase City Council's spending limit without a vote (update Prop H to reflect high cost of land) • Some members commented requesting acknowledgement of impact of sea level rise on the loss of beaches • City's Sea Level Rise Vulnerability Analysis identifies coastal areas vulnerable to sea level rise hazards, such as state beaches. State beaches are designated as open space but are not part of the open space required by the 15% Growth Management Open Space Standard. 	<p>1. Keep standard in as exists Growth Management Program.</p> <p>Staff recommends that the Open Space Standard remain as it is in the Growth Management Program. Because of the challenges in securing vacant available land for more open space than is currently planned, options for a different open space standard are limited and involve additional cost to the city.</p>
	<p>2. Remove standard from Growth Management Program.</p>
	<p>3. Change standard (increase, decrease, modify metric, etc.).</p>

Notes or Resources

Approved minutes from the September 22, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting.
[PowerPoint](#) presentation from the September 22, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting.
[Agenda packet](#) (staff report for the Open Space Standard item begins on page 6) from the September 22, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting.

The Mar. 13, 2007, City Council staff report and final committee report can be viewed here:

- [City Council Staff Report](#)
- [Final Committee Report \(part 1\)](#)
- [Final Committee Report \(part 2\)](#)
- [Final Committee Report \(part 3\)](#)

[Annual Open Space Status Report for Fiscal Year 2021-22](#)

[General Plan Open Space, Conservation and Recreation Element](#)

Nexus/Funding Sources

- Developer Contributions
- General Fund

Parks - Discussed September 22, 2022

3.0 acres of Community Park or Special Use Area per 1,000 population within the Park District [i.e., city quadrant]. must be scheduled for construction within a five-year period beginning at the time the need is first identified [when it is first identified that a park district has a deficit of park acres]. The five-year period shall not commence prior to August 22, 2017.

Key Takeaways from Committee Discussion on Standard	Options for Consideration
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Investigate idea of citywide fee to get money up front, as in-lieu fees paid into the accounts over time • Consider prioritizing park projects based on 10-minute walk to serve residents that don't have parks nearby to help address issues of equity • Consider prioritizing areas without parks within a 10-minute walk • Questions asked if Park standard was exempt from some areas, like the Open Space standard. Although parks are a form of open space, the park standard is applicable in all areas of the city on a quadrant (i.e., park district) basis. The Open Space standard applies in Local Facility Management Zones 11-15 and 17-25, but not zones 1-10 and 16; this exemption is only to the Open Space standard. • Question asked if park in-lieu fees could be used to fund park projects. Park in-lieu fees can be used for new parks per Carlsbad Municipal Code Section 20.44.090. As of Sept. 30, 2022, the amount of collected park fees available to use in each quadrant is: NW \$2.5 Million, NE \$4.3 Million, SW \$584,000, and SE \$1.7 Million. The amount of available collected fees in each quadrant is currently not sufficient to acquire land, plan and construct a new city park, in addition to the existing developed and planned parks. • Environmental justice was briefly discussed and how it applies to the city; currently no areas in the city designated as environmental justice areas • Are we addressing what people want out of parks? In planning for parks do we also look at what people need? (this is the focus of the Parks & Recreation Dept. Master Plan, which is currently being updated) • Concern when passive open spaces are counted as park space 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Keep standard in as exists Growth Management Program. Staff recommends that the Parks Standard remain as it is in the Growth Management Program. Providing substantially more acres of park land per 1,000 population cannot be guaranteed due to the challenges in securing vacant land available for parks (i.e., land which is not already otherwise designated for natural open space, requisite housing, or allowable commercial/industrial uses) as the city matures. 2. Remove standard from Growth Management Program. 3. Change standard (increase, decrease, modify metric, etc.). If the committee wants to pursue recommending an increase to the park standard, the following is an option for consideration: Increase the park standard to 4 acres per 1000 population, with added flexibility on how the standard is met: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Apply the standard on a citywide, non-quadrant basis (most cities surveyed – Oceanside, Encinitas, Vista, San Marcos, Poway, Chula Vista, San Diego – apply the park standard on a citywide basis) • Count the acreage of other recreational resources toward a “Park and Recreation” standard, such as The Crossings at Carlsbad Municipal Golf Course, city-controlled trails, city-controlled beaches, the city-leased Agua Hedionda Lagoon inner basin, and the recreation facilities constructed as a condition of the city’s approval for private developments.

- The impact of the homeless on parks needs to be addressed
- Equal spread of large Veterans Memorial Park across four quadrants seems to inflate quadrant acreage total beyond the NW
- Counting golf courses as recreation area raises equity issues
- Explore an increase in standard (look at adjacent cities)
- Consider moving away from only measuring community parks and special use areas
- Broaden concept of a park (e.g., community park, neighborhood park) for all
- Breakdown standards per thousand based on park type
- Take macro approach – citywide
- Interest in “Tier 2” standard shared as part of presentation that could be applied to certain types of projects (such as General Plan Amendments)
- Look into using density transfers to create park space (and proactively address state mandates/new policies for housing)
- Concern that lagoon trails are not counted as park recreation
- Impact of new parks on transportation standards should be consistently applied (Veterans Memorial Park downplayed transportation impacts while overemphasizing new park access)

Notes or Resources

Approved minutes from the September 22,2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting.
[PowerPoint](#) presentation from the September 22,2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting.
[Agenda packet](#) (staff report for the Parks item begins on page 24) from the September 22, 2022 Growth Management Citizens Committee meeting.

Carlsbad Parks & Recreation Department Master Plan Update: [City of Carlsbad \(carlsbadparksplan.com\)](http://carlsbadparksplan.com)

The [Carlsbad Tourism Business Improvement District Annual Report for FY 2018-19](#) indicates that there were 3.59 million visitors to Carlsbad during the reporting period.

[Parkscore for Carlsbad, CA – TPL](#)

Nexus/Funding Sources

- CFD #1
- Public Facility Impact Fees
- Park Development Impact Fees
- Developer Contributions
- General Fund