



Agenda

Regular Meeting

Nov. 13, 2023, 6 p.m.

Welcome to the Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

We welcome your interest and involvement in the city's legislative process. This agenda includes information about topics coming before the Historic Preservation Commission and the action recommended by city staff. You can read about each topic in the staff reports, which are available on the city website.

How to watch

In Person



Historic Preservation Commission meetings take place at City Hall, 1200 Carlsbad Village Drive

Online



Watch the livestream and replay past meetings on the city website, carlsbadca.gov/residents/communication/city-tv-channel

How to participate

If you would like to provide comments to the Committee, please:

- Fill out a speaker request form, located in the foyer.
 - Submit the form to the Clerk before the item begins.
 - When it's your turn, the Clerk will call your name and invite you to the podium.
 - Speakers have three minutes, unless the presiding officer (usually the chair) changes that time.
 - You may not give your time to another person, but groups can select a single speaker as long as three other members of your group are present. Group representatives have 10 minutes unless that time is changed by the presiding officer or the commission.
-
- **In writing:** Email comments to planning@carlsbadca.gov. Comments received by 2 p.m. the day prior to the meeting will be shared with the commission prior to the meeting. When e-mailing comments, please identify in the subject line the agenda item to which your comments relate. All comments received will be included as part of the official record.

Reasonable accommodations

Persons with a disability may request an agenda packet in appropriate alternative formats as required by the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990. Reasonable accommodations and auxiliary aids will be provided to effectively allow participation in the meeting. Please contact the City Manager's Office at 442-339-2821 (voice), 711 (free relay service for TTY users), 760-720-9461 (fax) or manager@carlsbadca.gov by noon on Monday the day of the meeting to make arrangements. City staff will respond to requests before the start of the meeting, and will seek to resolve requests before the start of the meeting in order to maximize accessibility.

CALL TO ORDER:

ROLL CALL:

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Minutes of the Regular Meeting held on May 8, 2023

PUBLIC COMMENT: *The Brown Act allows any member of the public to comment on items not on the agenda. Please treat others with courtesy, civility, and respect. Members of the public may participate in the meeting by submitting comments as provided on the front page of this agenda. The Commission will receive comments in the beginning of the meeting. In conformance with the Brown Act, no action can occur on these items.*

DEPARTMENTAL REPORTS:

1. Three on Garfield Environmental Impact Report: Review the Three on Garfield Environmental Impact Report and provide feedback to staff. (Staff contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development)

Recommended Action: Review the Three on Garfield Environmental Impact Report and provide feedback to staff.

2. Historic Preservation Commission Website: Create an ad-hoc subcommittee and appoint two members to assist staff with the development of the Historic Preservation Commission website. (Staff contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development)

Recommended Action: Create and appoint two members to the ad-hoc subcommittee.

3. 2024 Historic Preservation Commission Meeting Calendar: Adoption of a resolution approving the 2024 Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Calendar.

Recommended Action: Adopt the resolution.

COMMISSION MEMBER COMMENTS:

STAFF COMMENTS:

ADJOURNMENT:



Minutes

Regular Meeting
May 8, 2023, 6 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER: 6 p.m.

ROLL CALL: Chair Majer, Vice-Chair Díaz, Commissioners Ly, Schreiberman, Jacobs, and Ex-Officio Planning Commissioner Lafferty.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Vice-Chair Díaz led the Pledge of Allegiance.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES:

Minutes of the Regular Meeting held on March 13, 2023.

Motion by Commissioner Jacobs, seconded by Vice-Chair Diaz, to approve the minutes as presented. Motion carried unanimously, 5/0.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

DEPARTMENTAL REPORTS:

1. **Ratifying Actions Taken on March 13, 2023:** Adoption of a resolution to ratify, confirm, and approve actions taken by the Historic Preservation Commission on March 13, 2023. (Staff contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development)

Recommendation: Adopt the resolution.

Motion by Commissioner Schreiberman, seconded by Commissioner Schreiberman, to approve the resolution of the Regular Meeting held on June 21, 2023. Motion carried, 5/0.

2. **Third-Grade Annual Art Contest Update:** Receive overview of the third-grade annual art contest program and provide feedback as necessary. (Staff contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development (Staff contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development)

Recommendation: Receive overview and provide feedback.

Assistant Director of Community Development Mike Strong introduced the item and Deputy Library Director Sheila Crosby provided the Historic Preservation Commission with an overview of the program and June 13th award presentation.

Deputy Library Director Sheila Crosby responded to Commissioner Jacobs' interest in the anticipated participation rate.

The Commission received the overview.

3. **Historic Plaque Program:** Receive overview of various types of plaque programs and provide feedback as necessary. (Staff contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development)

Recommendation: Receive overview and provide feedback.

Assistant Director of Community Development Mike Strong introduced the item and provided a PowerPoint presentation (on file in the Office of the City Clerk).

The Commission received the report and provided feedback, asking for more information on implementation costs, potential grants or subsidy programs, different sign types, encouraging retroactive participation, and leveraging technology.

COMMISSION LIAISON ANNOUNCEMENTS: None.

COMMISSIONER COMMENTS:

Commissioner Jacobs provided an update to the Commission regarding the Growth Management Citizens Committee and indicated that the committee completed its work in April 2023.

Commissioner Díaz provided an update to the Commission on the Carlsbad Village Barrio Design Review Committee's work.

ADJOURNMENT:

Chair Majer adjourned the meeting at 6:36 p.m.

Mike Strong
Assistant Director of Community
Development



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Staff Report

Meeting Date: Nov. 13, 2023

To: Historic Preservation Commission

From: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development

Staff Contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development
Mike.Strong@carlsbadca.gov, 442-339-2721

Subject: Three on Garfield Environmental Impact Report

Recommended Action

Review the Three on Garfield Environmental Impact Report and provide feedback to staff.

Executive Summary

Cities and counties weigh a variety of factors when deciding whether to approve a proposed development project or discretionary project. One such factor is what kind of effect a project would have on the environment. The term "environment" includes natural and man-made elements of our surroundings. This includes land, air, water, minerals, plants, animals and noise. It also includes things like historic buildings or structures.

As part of the environmental review of development projects affecting historic buildings or structures, the Historic Preservation Commission may review and comment upon the adequacy of the environmental document during the public review period under California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). The City of Carlsbad is currently processing an Environmental Impact Report for the Three on Garfield project. Staff will provide a brief overview of CEQA, the environmental review process, and ask the Commission to review and comment on the Three on Garfield's EIR.

EIRs do not advocate either approval or denial of a project. The feedback received from the Commission and other information received from the environmental review process helps decision-makers decide whether to approve, conditionally approve, or deny a project.

Explanation & Analysis

The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) was adopted in 1970 and is a procedural statute designed to inform decision makers and public about potential environmental effects of projects. CEQA is listed under sections 21000 et seq. of the Public Resources Code (PRC) with Guidelines for implementation codified in the California Code of Regulations (CCR), Title 14, Chapter 3, Sections 15000 et seq. Although one of the most important goals of CEQA is to provide decision makers with information about the environmental impacts of projects prior to

granting approval, another equally important goal is to allow the public to comment on the impacts of projects in their community.

If a project is not exempt from environmental review, the next step is to prepare an initial study. If the initial study shows that the project may have a significant effect on the environment, the next step is to prepare the more extensive environmental impact report. For the Three on Garfield project, the report prepared can be referred to by the initials "EIR."

An EIR is a detailed analysis of a proposed project's potentially significant effect on the environment. An EIR is an extensive environmental document, which contains a number of different items, such as:

- The report describes the proposed project. The EIR must include a description of the physical environmental conditions in the vicinity of the project as they exist at the time the notice of preparation is published.
- The report identifies and analyzes each significant environmental impact expected to result from the proposed project.
- The report also recommends steps to avoid or minimize those impacts. These actions are called "mitigation measures." Mitigation measures must be fully enforceable through permit conditions, agreements, or other legally binding instruments.
- The report must also identify all significant environmental effects which cannot be avoided with the proposed project.
- Alternative project options are considered in an EIR, including the option of "no project."

The City of Carlsbad prepared a Draft EIR for the Three on Garfield project. The project applicant, John Beery, Beery Group, Inc, is proposing the demolition of an existing three-story structure, containing three attached residential air-space condominiums, each with a first-floor, two-car garage, accessed from Beech Avenue, and the construction of three attached, three-story residential air-space condominiums with first-floor garages. The proposed Three on Garfield project is located on a 0.16-acre infill site at 2685, 2687, and 2689 Garfield Street in the northwestern portion of the city.

The applicant has applied for a number of entitlement applications, including a Planned Development Permit (PUD) to facilitate individual ownership of units; a Site Development Plan (SDP) as required for development within the Beach Area Overlay Zone; a Coastal Development Permit (CDP) for development on a site located in the Coastal Zone; a Minor Subdivision (MS) to create air-space condominiums; and a Nonconforming Construction Permit (NCP) to allow the continuation of the legally established use of three dwelling units on a property where two dwelling units are permitted. No General Plan Land Use or Zoning changes are proposed. No Local Coastal Program Land Use or Zoning changes are proposed.

A Notice of Availability of the Draft EIR was published in the San Diego Union Tribune on Oct. 30, 2023. The Draft EIR is on file with the City of Carlsbad Planning Division, located at 1635 Faraday Avenue, Carlsbad CA 92008 and copies of the Draft EIR are available at the City of Carlsbad website at <http://www.carlsbadca.gov/services/depts/planning/agendas.asp>. The

Draft EIR is also available at the City Clerk's Office, 1200 Carlsbad Village Drive, and the city libraries. The Draft EIR will be available for public review and comment from October 30, 2023, through December 15, 2023.

Pursuant to section 2.42.040 of the Carlsbad Municipal Code (CMC), as part of the environmental review of development projects affecting historic buildings or structures, as identified in the environmental study, the Historic Preservation Commission may review and comment upon the adequacy of the environmental document during the public review period under CEQA. Staff is asking the Commission to review and comment on the Three on Garfield's EIR. Oral comments made during the Nov. 13, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission meeting will be summarized for inclusion in the Final EIR. Members of the public wishing their verbatim comments to be incorporated are directed to submit their comments in writing. Pursuant to section 15204 of the CEQA Guidelines, in reviewing Draft EIRs, persons and public agencies should focus on the sufficiency of the document in identifying and analyzing the possible impacts on the environment and ways in which the significant effects of the project might be avoided or mitigated. The decision-makers will consider the information in the Final EIR along with other information presented during the approval process when determining whether to adopt or modify the proposed project. Pursuant to State CEQA Guidelines Section 15002(h), the information in the Final EIR does not control the city's ultimate decision on approval of any component of the proposal.

Fiscal Analysis

There is no direct fiscal impact associated with receiving this information report.

Environmental Evaluation (CEQA)

The action before the Planning Commission is statutorily exempt from the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15262, Feasibility and Planning Studies. This organizational and administrative activity relates to the ongoing study of the Three of Garfield project. This discussion does not have a legally binding effect on any possible future discretionary action.

The EIR is an informational document that is intended to inform the city's decision-makers and the public of the significant environmental effects of adopting the Three on Garfield project, and associated implementation measures, and the alternatives analyzed. Public input is an important component to the decision-making process.

Interested parties may provide written comments on the Draft EIR before the end of the 45-day public review and comment period. Written comments on the Draft EIR must be submitted to:

Eric Lardy, City Planner
City of Carlsbad Planning Division
1635 Faraday Avenue Carlsbad, CA 92008

Comments may also be e-mailed to Eric.Lardy@carlsbadca.gov. Following the 45-day public review and comment period for the Draft EIR, the city will prepare a written response for each written comment received on the Draft EIR. Public input received and technical information

prepared during the environmental review process will be utilized in preparing a Final EIR to support the analysis of the proposed project. The written comments and city responses to those comments, as well as any required EIR changes, will be incorporated into a Final EIR. The Final EIR will be reviewed by the city at the time the proposed project is considered for approval.

Exhibits

None.



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Staff Report

Meeting Date: Nov. 13, 2023

To: Historic Preservation Commission

From: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development

Staff Contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development
Mike.strong@carlsbadca.gov, 442-339-2721

Subject: Historic Preservation Commission Website

Recommended Action

Create an ad-hoc subcommittee and appoint two members to assist staff with the development of the Historic Preservation Commission website.

Executive Summary

City commissions and boards may appoint ad hoc subcommittees or members to ad hoc subcommittees as needed. The purpose of this report is to form an ad-hoc subcommittee to assist staff with updating the city's website. Based on their review and assessment of the city's website, the subcommittee would develop recommendations and report to the staff liaison in fall 2023. The full Historic Preservation Commission would receive an informational presentation on all final recommendations in early 2024.

This item is included in the 2023-2024 Work Plan.

Explanation & Analysis

Historic Preservation is the practice of preserving and ensuring the continued use of the places and buildings that represent our city's history. Using online tools and technology could be a logical extension of the city's commitment to historic preservation.

Pursuant to Section 2.15.20(E) of the Carlsbad Municipal Code, a city commission may organize ad hoc subcommittee of a limited duration. Forming a limited subcommittee to assist staff in updating the website would be an efficient way for interested commissioners to devote the time to this assignment and determine how best to improve some of the city's online resources. The subcommittee would be tasked with reviewing the city's website, discussing and analyzing how to provide the public with easy access to hands-on information, and identifying changes to the city's website to better use technology and data to promote, preserve, and enhance historic properties and to provide the public with the most up-to-date historic resources information.

Commission members are being asked to create a limited, ad-hoc subcommittee and appoint two members to serve. Once appointed, city staff would determine the availability of the

subcommittee members to virtually meet at a specified dates and times, scheduling meetings on an as-needed basis. It is anticipated that the subcommittee would meet virtually two or three times in fall 2023. City staff would work to publish the subcommittee's desired changes by the end of the calendar year. The full Historic Perseveration Commission would receive an informational presentation on all final recommendations in early 2024.

Fiscal Analysis

There is no direct fiscal impact associated with receiving this informational report.

No budget has been allocated to support this program. Direct and indirect costs associated with developing a Historic Preservation Commission website would likely fall within the existing department budget, working in collaboration with Information Technology and their Geographic Information Systems (GIS) section if needed.

Environmental Evaluation (CEQA)

Pursuant to Public Resources Code Section 21065, this action does not constitute a "project" within the meaning of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) in that it has no potential to cause either a direct physical change in the environment, or a reasonably foreseeable indirect physical change in the environment, and therefore does not require environmental review.

Exhibits

None.



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Staff Report

Meeting Date: Nov. 13, 2023

To: Historic Preservation Commission

From: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development

Staff Contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development
Mike.Strong@carlsbadca.gov, 442-339-2721

Subject: 2024 Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Calendar

Recommended Action

Adopt a resolution approving the 2024 Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Calendar.

Executive Summary

Staff is recommending that the Historic Preservation Commission adopt the proposed 2024 Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Calendar to assist with the Commission's public engagement and other planning purposes. Following the adoption of its meeting schedule, staff will update the Commission's website and other communications accordingly.

Explanation & Analysis

The Carlsbad Municipal Code (CMC) provides that a board or commission may adopt rules and regulations, including bylaws governing its activities and operations. Pursuant to Section 2.15.030 of the CMC, each board or commission shall meet in accordance with its approved regular meeting calendar. A Regular Meeting calendar provides for the meeting day, location, and time of board and commission meetings.

On an annual basis the Historic Preservation Commission reviews its planned meeting dates to determine whether any changes should be made for the coming calendar year. For calendar year 2024, staff proposes one regular meeting every other month on the second Monday of that month, with exceptions provided for when a meeting would fall on a city-observed holiday. Adjustments to the proposed Regular Meeting calendar for 2024 are proposed to provide the Commission with an opportunity to make advance planning arrangements for time off during the fall season. No meeting is proposed for Nov. 2024, which falls during a holiday week. In addition to the regularly scheduled meetings, the Commission may call for special meetings as needed throughout the year. All regular meetings will be held at 6 p.m. at the Council Chamber at City Hall at 1200 Carlsbad Village Drive. All meeting calendars for each board or commission is posted on the corresponding board or commission webpage.

Fiscal Analysis

There is no direct fiscal impact associated with receiving this information report.

Environmental Evaluation (CEQA)

The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requires analysis of agency approvals of discretionary “projects.” A “project” under CEQA, is defined as “an activity which may cause either a direct physical change in the environment, or a reasonably foreseeable indirect physical change in the environment” (Public Resource Code section 21065). The proposed action does not constitute a “project” within the meaning of CEQA in accordance with Public Resources Code section 21065 or CEQA Guidelines section 15378. The adoption of a Regular Meeting schedule has no potential to cause either a direct physical change in the environment or a reasonably foreseeable indirect physical change in the environment.

Exhibits

1. Historic Preservation Commission resolution

RESOLUTION NO. _____

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF CARLSBAD, CALIFORNIA, ESTABLISHING THE COMMISSION'S REGULAR MEETING CALENDAR FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2024

WHEREAS, Section 2.15.030 of the Carlsbad Municipal Code requires each board or commission to meet in accordance with its approved regular meeting schedule; and

WHEREAS, the Historic Preservation Commission desires to adopt a 2024 Regular Meeting Calendar; and

WHEREAS, the action to adopt a Regular Meeting calendar was evaluated for environmental processing in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act, (CEQA, Public Resources Code section 21000 et. seq.), and its implementing regulations (the CEQA Guidelines, Article 14 of the California Code of Regulations section 15000 et. seq.). The action does not constitute a "project" within the meaning of CEQA in accordance with Public Resources Code section 21065 or CEQA Guidelines section 15378. The project, therefore, is not subject to CEQA.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Historic Preservation Commission of the City of Carlsbad, California, as follows:

1. That the above recitations are true and correct.
2. Regular Meetings of the Historic Preservation Commission in calendar year 2024 shall be held on the date and time indicated on Attachment A. Unless a change is indicated in the public notice of the meeting, Regular Meetings will commence at 6 pm in the City Council Chamber located at 1200 Carlsbad Village Drive, Carlsbad CA 92008.
3. The Commission may adjourn, continue or re-continue any regular, adjourned regular, special, or adjourned special meeting to a time and place specified in the order or resolution of adjournment.

PASSED, APPROVED AND ADOPTED at a Regular Meeting of the Historic Commission of the City of Carlsbad on the ___ day of _____, 2023, by the following vote, to wit:

AYES:

NAYS:

ABSTAIN:

ABSENT:

CHAD MAJER, CHAIR

ELIZABETH SNYDER,
SENIOR OFFICE SPECIALIST

2024

HISTORIC PRESERVATION MEETING CALENDAR

January						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
	1	2	3	4	5	6
7	8	9	10	11	12	13
14	15	16	17	18	19	20
21	22	23	24	25	26	27
28	29	30	31			

February						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
				1	2	3
4	5	6	7	8	9	10
11	12	13	14	15	16	17
18	19	20	21	22	23	24
25	26	27	28	29		

March						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
					1	2
3	4	5	6	7	8	9
10	11	12	13	14	15	16
17	18	19	20	21	22	23
24	25	26	27	28	29	30
						31

April						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
	1	2	3	4	5	6
7	8	9	10	11	12	13
14	15	16	17	18	19	20
21	22	23	24	25	26	27
28	29	30				

May						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
			1	2	3	4
5	6	7	8	9	10	11
12	13	14	15	16	17	18
19	20	21	22	23	24	25
26	27	28	29	30	31	

June						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
						1
2	3	4	5	6	7	8
9	10	11	12	13	14	15
16	17	18	19	20	21	22
23	24	25	26	27	28	29
						30

July						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
	1	2	3	4	5	6
7	8	9	10	11	12	13
14	15	16	17	18	19	20
21	22	23	24	25	26	27
28	29	30	31			



August						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
				1	2	3
4	5	6	7	8	9	10
11	12	13	14	15	16	17
18	19	20	21	22	23	24
25	26	27	28	29	30	31

September						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
8	9	10	11	12	13	14
15	16	17	18	19	20	21
22	23	24	25	26	27	28
29	30					

October						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
		1	2	3	4	5
6	7	8	9	10	11	12
13	14	15	16	17	18	19
20	21	22	23	24	25	26
27	28	29	30	31		

November						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
					1	2
3	4	5	6	7	8	9
10	11	12	13	14	15	16
17	18	19	20	21	22	23
24	25	26	27	28	29	30

December						
S	M	T	W	T	F	S
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
8	9	10	11	12	13	14
15	16	17	18	19	20	21
22	23	24	25	26	27	28
29	30	31				

 6 p.m. Historic Preservation Meetings
 City Holiday, City Offices Closed