



Agenda

Regular Meeting
Jan. 8, 2024, 6 p.m.

Welcome to the Historic Preservation Commission Meeting

We welcome your interest and involvement in the city's legislative process. This agenda includes information about topics coming before the Historic Preservation Commission and the action recommended by city staff. You can read about each topic in the staff reports, which are available on the city website.

How to watch

In Person



Historic Preservation Commission meetings take place at City Hall, 1200 Carlsbad Village Drive

Online



Watch the livestream and replay past meetings on the city website, carlsbadca.gov/residents/communication/city-tv-channel

How to participate

If you would like to provide comments to the Committee, please:

- Fill out a speaker request form, located in the foyer.
 - Submit the form to the Clerk before the item begins.
 - When it's your turn, the Clerk will call your name and invite you to the podium.
 - Speakers have three minutes, unless the presiding officer (usually the chair) changes that time.
 - You may not give your time to another person, but groups can select a single speaker as long as three other members of your group are present. Group representatives have 10 minutes unless that time is changed by the presiding officer or the commission.
-
- **In writing:** Email comments to planning@carlsbadca.gov. Comments received by 2 p.m. the day prior to the meeting will be shared with the commission prior to the meeting. When e-mailing comments, please identify in the subject line the agenda item to which your comments relate. All comments received will be included as part of the official record.

Reasonable accommodations

Persons with a disability may request an agenda packet in appropriate alternative formats as require by the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990. Reasonable accommodations and auxiliary aids will be provided to effectively allow participation in the meeting. Please contact the City Manager's Office at 442-339-2821 (voice), 711 (free relay service for TTY users), 760-720-9461 (fax) or manager@carlsbadca.gov by noon on Monday the day of the meeting to make arrangements. City staff will respond to requests before the start of the meeting, and will seek to resolve requests before the start of the meeting in order to maximize accessibility.

CALL TO ORDER:

ROLL CALL:

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE:

APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Minutes of the Regular Meeting held on Nov. 13, 2023

Minutes of the Special Meeting held on Nov. 30, 2023

PUBLIC COMMENT: *The Brown Act allows any member of the public to comment on items not on the agenda. Please treat others with courtesy, civility, and respect. Members of the public may participate in the meeting by submitting comments as provided on the front page of this agenda. The Commission will receive comments in the beginning of the meeting. In conformance with the Brown Act, no action can occur on these items.*

DEPARTMENTAL REPORTS:

1. **HISTORIC PLAQUE PROGRAM:** Develop a uniform Interpretive Plaque Program for historic locations. (Staff contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development)

Recommended Action: Review the draft Interpretive Plaque Program for historic locations and provide feedback to staff.

2. **SELECTION OF COMMISSION CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2024:** Appoint one commissioner to serve as Chair and one commissioner to serve as Vice-Chair of the Commission for a term ending December 2024 or until replacements are selected.

Recommended Action: Appoint one member to serve as Chair and one member to serve as Vice Chair.

3. **ADDITIONAL HISTORIC PRESERVATION BENEFITS AND INCENTIVES:** Initiate a work program to develop recommendations for historic preservation benefits and incentives.

Recommended Action: Initiate the work program.

COMMISSION MEMBER COMMENTS:

STAFF COMMENTS:

ADJOURNMENT:



Nov. 13, 2023, 6 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER: 6 p.m.

ROLL CALL: Majer, Diaz, May, Jacobs, Schreibman, Lafferty

ANNOUNCEMENT OF CONCURRENT MEETINGS: None.

INVOCATION: None.

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Commissioner Diaz led the Pledge of Allegiance.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: Minutes of regular the Regular Meeting held on May 8, 2023
Motion by Commissioner May, seconded by Commissioner Schreibman, to approve the minutes as presented. Motion carried unanimously, 5/0.

PRESENTATIONS: None.

PUBLIC COMMENT: None.

DEPARTMENTAL REPORTS:

1. **THREE ON GARFIELD ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT:** Review the Three on Garfield Environmental Impact Report and provide feedback to staff. (Staff contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development)

Recommended Action: Review the Three on Garfield Environmental Impact Report and provide feedback to staff.

City Planner Eric Lardy presented the report and reviewed a PowerPoint presentation (on file in the Office of the City Clerk).

Wayne Brechtel expressed his support of the applicants request for the Three on Garfield project.

Owner of Three on Garfield Rene Wailes expressed her support of the Three on Garfield project.

John Beery project architect spoke in support of applicants request for the Three on Garfield project.

Commissioners Diaz asked for further explanation of the Environmental Impact Report. Shannon Davis the Director of Architectural History for ASM Affiliates explained why Three

on Garfield meets the criteria for architectural style of post modernism. The primary author of the report Laura continued the discussion to support the historical criteria of post modernism.

Discussion on Three on Garfield ensued amongst Commission Members.

Motion by Commissioner Diaz, seconded by Commissioner Jacobs, requesting for a Special Meeting to be scheduled to continue the discussion on the Environmental Impact Report. Motion carried unanimously, 5/0.

2. **HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION WEBSITE**: Create an ad-hoc subcommittee and appoint two members to assist staff with the development of the Historic Preservation Commission website. (Staff contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development

Recommended Action: Create and appoint two members to the ad-hoc subcommittee.

Community Development Assistant Director Mike Strong provided background on the ad hoc subcommittee.

Discussion on the ad-hoc subcommittee continued amongst Commission Members.

Motion by Commissioner Diaz, seconded by Commissioner Jacobs, to appoint Commissioner May and Commissioner Schreibman to the ad-hoc subcommittee. Motion carried unanimously, 5/0.

3. **2024 HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING CALENDAR**: Adoption of resolution 2023-003 approving the 2024 Historic Preservation Commission Regular Meeting Calendar.

Recommended Action: Adopt Resolution No. 2023-003

Strong gave explanation of the Historic Preservation Commission Meetings scheduled for 2024.

Motion by Commissioner Schreibman, seconded by Commissioner May to adopt Resolution No. 2023-003. Motion carried unanimously, 5/0.

STAFF COMMENTS: Strong provided an update on the Mills Act Program.

ADJOURNMENT: 7:01 p.m.

Elizabeth Snyder
Senior Office Specialist



Historic Preservation Commission

Special Meeting

Minutes

Council Chamber
1200 Carlsbad Village Drive
Carlsbad, CA 92008

Nov. 30, 2023, 6 p.m.

CALL TO ORDER: 6 p.m.

ROLL CALL: Majer, Jacobs, May, (Schreibman – Absent).

Diaz – TELECONFERENCE LOCATION - 2500 Larkspur Landing Circle, Room 101
Larkspur, CA 94939

PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE: Commissioner Jacobs lead the Pledge of Allegiance.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: None.

PRESENTATIONS: None.

CONSENT CALENDAR: None.

DEPARTMENTAL REPORTS:

This item was continued from the Nov. 13, 2023, Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

1. **THREE ON GARFIELD ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT:** Review the Three on Garfield Environmental Impact Report and provide feedback to staff. (Staff contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development)

Recommended Action: Review the Three on Garfield Environmental Impact Report and provide feedback to staff.

Assistant Director of Community Development Mike Strong explained that the Commission had continued this item for further discussion from their Nov. 13, 2023, Regular Meeting. For that reason, there would not be another presentation and that Commission discussion would take place at this time.

Commissioner Diaz requested staff provide clarity between mitigation measures and alternatives in relation to the Environmental Impact Report.

City Planner Eric Lardy explained that there are two different things included in an Environmental Impact Report. The first is an evaluation of the environmental topic areas that could be potentially impacted and then mitigation measures which are actions that the City could take or conditions the City could take on the project to lessen those impacts. In response to an inquiry from Vice Chair Diaz, Mr. Lardy further explained that the purpose of the Environmental Impact Report is to study the range of alternatives and disclose publicly the impacts of those alternatives.

Discussion on Three on Garfield ensued amongst Commission Members.

Motion by Commissioner Jacobs, seconded by Vice Chair Diaz that the Historic Preservation Commission support the thoroughness and completeness of the Environmental Impact Report. 3/1/1 (May – No and Shreibman - Absent).

COMMISSION COMMENTARY AND REQUESTS FOR CONSIDERATION OF MATTERS: Chair Majer shared his concern about the Pool Hall in the Barrio for sale. He stated he would like to pay attention to the progress of the property.

ANNOUNCEMENTS: None.

STAFF COMMENTS: None.

ADJOURNMENT: 6:25 p.m.

Elizabeth Snyder
Senior Office Specialist



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Staff Report

Meeting Date: Jan. 8, 2024

To: Historic Preservation Commission

From: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development

Staff Contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development
Mike.strong@carlsbadca.gov, 442-339-2721

Subject: Historic Plaque Program

Recommended Action

Develop a uniform Interpretive Plaque Program for historic locations.

Executive Summary

This report provides an overview of the revised draft historic plaque program. This item was first presented on May 8, 2023, and is included in the existing Historic Preservation Commission (HPC) Work Plan and the 2023-2024 Draft HPC Work Plan (“Develop a Plaque Program for historic locations and other opportunities”).

Discussion

Plaque programs provide one of the most effective and least expensive ways of promoting historic awareness and promoting public appreciation for historic properties. A plaque program, organized and administered by a local agency and/or a historical society, involves the recognition and landmarking of local historic properties through the use of plaques. At its May 8, 2023, meeting, Historic Preservation Commission members received a high-level overview of the different types of plaque programs and recommended pursuing an “interpretive” type of program. This report is the outcome of the May 8, 2023 discussion.

An interpretive program involves the landmarking of historic sites using markers with customized wording describing the historic resource. Typically, these are mounted on or adjacent to the historic building or structure. Individually designated properties throughout the city would receive a bronze plaque to identify and celebrate the fact that the property is designated under the local register or is a property of interest. The revised draft historic plaque program is attached as Exhibit 1, which details plaque specifications, including shape, size, color and information the plaque must contain (such as historical name, date, etc.).

After the Historic Preservation Commission finalizes the plaque guidelines and criteria, city staff will return with a resolution to ratify Interpretive Plaque Program.

Fiscal Analysis

There is no direct fiscal impact associated with receiving this informational report. In terms of plaque program implementation, staff researched vendor costs and it is estimated that each

custom plaque would cost approximately \$1,500 to \$2,000 each. (Standard plaques cost much less.) Additional art development charges are anticipated to be \$70 to \$100 per hour. After the Historic Preservation Commission provides feedback on this item, city staff will further evaluate and report back on potential implementation costs. It is also recommended to compare prices, as they may vary from company to company.

Some cities allow the property owner to write the text, order, install and pay for the plaque. Other cities are responsible for writing the text, ordering and paying for the plaque with the property owner responsible for installation. Should the Historic Preservation Commission support the revised draft plaque program as set forth in Exhibit 1, the Historic Preservation Commission should separately discuss if either the city or the property owner is responsible for installing and paying for the plaque. As of this writing, no budget has been allocated to support this program. If the Historic Preservation Commission recommends that the city should sponsor and fund the program, the Historic Preservation Commission would also likely need to obtain authorization from the City Council to allocate funds to the program and to utilize funds for the Interpretive Plaque Program.

Environmental Evaluation (CEQA)

Pursuant to Public Resources Code Section 21065, this action does not constitute a “project” within the meaning of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) in that it has no potential to cause either a direct physical change in the environment, or a reasonably foreseeable indirect physical change in the environment, and therefore does not require environmental review.

Exhibits

1. Revised draft plaque program

**Historic Preservation Commission
Interpretive Plaque Program
Guidelines and Criteria**

Program Goals & Objectives

- Recognize and landmark local historic resources, sites and location of events or persons that are significant in the area of architecture, archaeology, Carlsbad history and traditional culture.
- Promote preservation and rehabilitation of historical properties, sites and structures.

Program Form

Customized Plaque:

- Specially-made cast metal plaque - Bronze metal, dark green finish w/rear & front rosettes for mounting; however a smaller size is acceptable.
- Size and layout: Plaque must be rectangular in shape, 17" x 12" minimum size.
- Design: Plaque must contain City Seal, Local Register site number (if applicable), name of resource. Includes at the bottom of each plaque:
"COURTESY OF THE CITY OF CARLSBAD HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION"
- Text: Up to nine lines of customized wording describing the historic resource. Content includes a brief description of the significance of the resource and a metal photo when available (text in sentence case structure). Text must be appropriate reading level. Use short sentences and keep text blocks short.
- Font: Use type styles and sizes and are easy to read.

Program Criteria

A. Eligibility:

- Option 1. Meet all of the following criteria:
 - Be of a significant age relative to the founding of the city
 - Have importance/significance in the "collective memory" of the community by qualifying as the "first" of its kind in the city (i.e. first post office, first school, etc.)
 - Represent the cultural history of the region or the city
- Option 2. Be listed in the Local, State, or National Register

B. Process of identifying plaque locations:

- a. Historic Preservation Commission may identify up to 2 sites each year to be presented to the City Council for approval.
- b. Private Citizens may nominate sites by submitting recommendation in writing to the Historic Preservation Commission. Consideration of nominated sites will be batched and grouped together and be considered at the end of each calendar year.
- c. The Commission will retain responsibility on which sites to recommend to Council.

C. Potential conditions, agreements and responsibilities:

- The property owner must sign a letter of agreement with the city in which the owner agrees to maintain the structure's historic integrity.
 - The agreement may also state that the program is voluntary and no requirements of the owner now or in the future other than to return the plaque to the City of Carlsbad in the event they remove it from the current location.
 - The Historic Preservation Commission may revoke the privilege of displaying the plaque should the building or structure fail to comply with the conditions.
- City staff to collaborate with property owner on content, provided it meets established criteria.
- Installation method to be site specific and, if on private property, approved by property owner. The plaque may only be displayed on the building or structure for which it is issued.
- When determining installation location, consider the relationship between the sign and the subject it is interpreting, the potential for vandalism, and how accessible the sign is to persons with disabilities.
- If it is lost or stolen, the property owner must notify the Historic Preservation Commission of its loss. A new plaque may be issued upon approval of a new application.
- Other potential conditions, agreements and responsibilities may be considered as part of the historic designation process (if applicable).



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Staff Report

Meeting Date: Jan. 8, 2024

To: Historic Preservation Commission

From: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development

Staff Contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development
Mike.strong@carlsbadca.gov, 442-339-2721

Subject: Selection of Commission Chair and Vice Chair for Calendar Year 2024

Recommended Action

That the Historic Preservation Commission appoint one commissioner to serve as Chair and appoint one commissioner to serve as Vice-Chair of the Commission for a term ending December 2024 or until replacements are selected.

Discussion

Each calendar year the Commission selects a new Chair and Vice-Chair through nomination and selection by a vote of a majority of the commission.

Fiscal Analysis

There is no direct fiscal impact.

Environmental Evaluation (CEQA)

The California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) requires analysis of agency approvals of discretionary “projects.” A “project” under CEQA, is defined as “an activity which may cause either a direct physical change in the environment, or a reasonably foreseeable indirect physical change in the environment” (Public Resource Code section 21065). The proposed action does not constitute a “project” within the meaning of CEQA in accordance with Public Resources Code section 21065 or CEQA Guidelines section 15378.

Exhibits

None.



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

Staff Report

Meeting Date: Jan. 8, 2024

To: Historic Preservation Commission

From: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development

Staff Contact: Mike Strong, Assistant Director of Community Development
Mike.strong@carlsbadca.gov, 442-339-2721

Subject: Additional Historic Preservation Benefits and Incentives

Recommended Action

Initiate a work program to develop recommendations for historic preservation benefits and incentives.

Executive Summary

During the course of developing the local Mills Act Program, the Historic Preservation Commission reviewed and considered other ways to incentivize Mills Act program participation and/or help support local historic preservation efforts. The discussion focused on the following:

1. Expanded use of a historic property to allow more home-based business activity.
2. Development standard flexibility such as parking and setbacks.
3. Façade preservation easements for possible tax incentive.
4. Official recognition or awards by the Historic Preservation Commission.

At its Jan. 8, 2024, meeting, the Historic Preservation Commission will schedule a series of meetings to cover certain issues in more detail before making a recommendation to the City Council. In general, the concept of an expanded review process in a public setting increases public input and facilitates additional dialogue. The study session format will provide the Historic Preservation Commission with an opportunity to learn more about the benefits and incentives, hear from various residents and stakeholders, and to discuss preliminary issues/concerns. Furthermore, study sessions in advance of a final recommendation will allow the Historic Preservation Commission to methodically work through benefits and incentives.

Discussion

The City Council approved a local Mills Act program on Nov. 3, 2022, when it approved various amendments to the city's historical preservation ordinance (Ordinance No. CS-438, which amended Carlsbad Municipal Code Title 22). California's Mills Act provides cities with a mechanism to encourage the preservation of their historic buildings. It allows the city to give owners of qualified historic properties who actively participate in the restoration and maintenance of their properties a reduction in their property tax.

During the course of developing the ordinance, the Historic Preservation Commission also recommended that the City Council direct staff to further investigate additional benefits and incentives. The benefits and incentives presented to the City Council are provided below and listed in Table 1.

- Expanded home based businesses: A designated historic resource that is listed in the Register with an active Mills Act Contract may operate a home occupation, subject to Section 21.10.040 of Title 21. One option is to allow on-premises employees and customers.
- Development standard flexibility: Designated historic resources listed in the Local Register may be allowed to deviate from certain development standards, so long as the improvements are designed by an individual meeting the applicable Professional Qualification Standards, and the improvements are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards, as well as the State Historical Building Code if applicable.
- Facade preservation easements: Preservation easements on the facades of buildings designated as a Designated Historic Resource may be acquired by a nonprofit group through purchase, donation, or documentation.
- Official recognition and awards: The Historic Preservation Commission may recognize those projects involving designated historic resources that have demonstrated a high level of commitment to maintaining or restoring the historic integrity of the resource.

The proposed work plan and schedule proposes a series of meetings with the Historic Preservation Commission over the next nine (9) months to discuss different aspects and components related to historic preservation benefits and incentives. The “review meetings” schedule is reflected in Table 1.

Table 1: Historic Preservation Commission Review Schedule

Meeting No.	Topic or Discussion Item Covered	Target Date
1	Introductory meeting and initiation of the work program	Jan. 8, 2024
2	Expanded use of a historic property to allow more home-based business activity.	March 11, 2024
3	Development standard flexibility such as parking and setbacks.	May 13, 2024
4	1) Façade preservation easements for possible tax incentive; and 2) Official recognition or awards by the Commission	July 8, 2024
5	Finalize recommendations for City Council consideration to initiate formal code amendments or policy changes.	Sep. 9, 2024

It is important to note that the Historic Preservation Commission may also want to consider other ways to incentivize Mills Act program participation and/or help support local historic preservation efforts by amending the work program schedule at any point.

At the conclusion of the work program, city staff will present the recommendations to the City Council and seek authorization to initiate formal code amendments or policy changes. The Chair or Vice Chair will be responsible for representing the Historic Preservation Commission at this City Council meeting and for speaking in support of the Commission's recommendations.

Fiscal Analysis

There is no direct fiscal impact associated with receiving this informational report.

Environmental Evaluation (CEQA)

The action before the Historic Preservation Commission is to develop a work program to review and consider potential historic preservation benefits and incentives. The direction received at the Jan. 8, 2024, meeting is to help facilitate the commission's review and public's interest in historic preservation benefits and incentives. This general direction does not have a legally binding effect on any possible future discretionary action.

Pursuant to Public Resources Code Section 21065, this action does not constitute a "project" within the meaning of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) in that it has no potential to cause either a direct physical change in the environment, or a reasonably foreseeable indirect physical change in the environment, and therefore does not require environmental review.

Exhibits

None.